

GLOBAL BALTIMORE REPORT

UNIVERSITY
OF MARYLAND,
BALTIMORE
COUNTY

PROGRAM
IN GLOBAL
STUDIES



FALL 2015

FOREWORD

The Program in Global Studies at the University of Maryland, Baltimore County is focused on educating “global citizens” for the global century ahead. It looks to graduate people who can do well and “do good” in this world of rapid change, a world increasingly interconnected economically, politically and culturally. Our society needs individuals who can understand and act upon the global dimension of our collective problems. More specifically, private firms, government agencies and organizations within the civil society need members who can help them face the challenges and opportunities generated by globalization.

With this mission in mind, undergraduate students enrolled in the course *Approaches to Globalization* in the spring of 2015 prepared case studies in which they analyzed how organizations based in the Baltimore area have experienced globalization. The best case studies were selected by the course instructor - Dr. Felipe Filomeno - and are published here in the *Global Baltimore Report*. Students chose which organizations to study at their own discretion. The diversity of organizations selected - ranging from a farmers’ market to a public school - reflects the diversity of interests and backgrounds of UMBC students. Using theories learned in class, students were instructed to bring out and interpret the global dimension of the activities of each organization. Often, this required interviews with representatives of organizations that had accepted an invitation to contribute to this class project.

By writing the case studies, students improved their skills in the areas of global awareness and global analysis. However, we hope that the organizations that collaborated with this project have also improved their awareness of globalization by providing information to our students. Moreover, we hope that the studies presented here help these organizations to better understand their engagement with global processes. Making sense of our local realities from a global perspective is a first step toward improving the position of Baltimore in its quest to integrate into the economic, political and cultural flows of globalization. At last, we would like to thank the students who participated in this project, including Hanna Dasoo and Manisha Vepa, who were responsible for the copy-editing of the manuscript.

Dr. Devin Hagerty, Director of the Program in Global Studies
Dr. Brigid Starkey, Assistant Director of the Program in Global Studies
Dr. Felipe Filomeno, Assistant Professor of Political Science and Global Studies

TABLE OF CONTENTS

- 1** *The Esperanza Centers' Role in Baltimore's Growing Cosmopolitan Society*
Christina Smith
- 2** *The Role of ESOL Education in the Integration of Central American Immigrants into the Baltimore Area*
Anna Kearns
- 3** *Globalization and the Conservationism of Baltimore's National Aquarium*
Matthew Knauer
- 4** *The Associated: Globally Engaging the Baltimore Jewish Community*
Arielle Erenrich
- 5** *Red Emma's Bookstore and Coffeehouse: Anarchism and Cosmopolitanism in Baltimore*
Megan Critzman
- 6** *YBI African Apparel and Fashion in Baltimore: an Anthropological Approach to a Small Globalized Business*
Mbalou Camara
- 7** *Guns, Butter, and Customs Regulations: A Case Study of Airschott, Inc.*
Hannah Schott
- 8** *Global Principles, Local Practices: Montessori Education in Baltimore*
Elizabeth Rudt
- 9** *Planting Seeds of Change and Growing Resistance: a Case Study of Baltimore's 32nd Street Farmers' Market*
Melina Latona
- 10** *The Growth and Benefits of Coffee Fair Trade: World Wide and Baltimore City*
Isabel Geisler

1

The Esperanza Centers' Role in Baltimore's Growing Cosmopolitan Society

Christina Smith

Introduction

Hundreds of years ago, Immanuel Kant predicted the rise of a world cosmopolitan society. To Kant, cosmopolitanism meant “the extension of the rights of man beyond the nation” (“Lecture 5”). He argued that someday all of humanity would live under a global cosmopolis, where everyone would operate under the same laws and values, thereby displaying a shared human nature. Kant understood that this would not occur overnight, and that humanity would have to endure years of wars, revolutions and turmoil before cosmopolitanism prevailed. Although he understood this could take hundreds of years, he asserted that the global cosmopolis would eventually ensue for three principal reasons: living in such a society would be moral, natural, and beneficial to both the individual and the larger community.

Today, there are forces working within the City of Baltimore to make local communities reflect Kant’s ideal of a global cosmopolis. The large influx of recent immigrants and the welcome they have received is evidence of this shift. Baltimore Mayor Stephanie Rawlings-Blake has publicly announced the desire to make Baltimore a city of immigrants, encouraging a blending of different peoples and groups within one open and accepting city. Baltimore is a multicultural city, but many citizens share the same idea: to care for their community and one another. This shift in Baltimore’s demographics and mindset will have effects on locations in the Fells Point neighborhood. The Esperanza Center is an immigrant-supporting organization located in Fells Point that for over 50 years has worked to provide “healthcare, social services, referrals, language classes and immigration legal services” to many individuals throughout Baltimore City and County (Esperanza Center). As cosmopolitanism expands in Baltimore for reasons of morality, nature and personal progress, it is likely that the Esperanza Center will experience a shift in its role, as it receives more funding, more recognition, and a more stable client base.

In order to learn more about Kant’s teachings, I read and analyzed two of his pieces: *Perpetual Peace* and *Idea of a Universal History on a Cosmopolitan Plan*. All information presented in this study about Kant’s theories comes from these two sources. The majority of the research about Esperanza Center comes from a personal interview with Diana Siemer, the Educational Services Manager at the Esperanza Center. When I interned for the Esperanza Center in the Spring of 2014, Ms. Siemer was my direct supervisor. I have also worked with her for three semesters as a volunteer. In addition to Ms. Siemer, I interviewed Carmalyn Dorsey, a former employee of Johns Hopkins, who partnered with the Esperanza Center to teach community health to nursing students. I also relied on a report from the Baltimore City’s Mayor’s Office and various other articles.

Theoretical approach

Immanuel Kant firmly believed in the emergence of a global cosmopolis. In his writings, he presented extensive rationale to support his theory of cosmopolitanism. However, for the purposes of the present analysis, I will focus on just three reasons Kant presented in support of the future emergence of cosmopolitanism. First, it is morally right to form a cosmopolitan society; second, a cosmopolitan society will emerge naturally; and third, the individual will benefit most from sacrificing some personal freedoms in order to join a global cosmopolitan society. Kant's arguments are based on logic. Even when he talks about morality, it is from a logical perspective. This is important to bear in mind when analyzing the validity of his propositions.

1. It is morally right to form a cosmopolitan society.

Kant believed that we have a moral duty to actively promote peace and live as global citizens. His writing focused on the political implications of a nation of citizens actively promoting peace; however, this would have many social effects as well. Kant also proposed the universal right to visitation of foreign lands. He believed that a foreigner should have the right to be treated without hostility even if he or she has arrived on the land of another ("Inter Kant"). Kant certainly believed that a nation should reserve the right to turn foreigners away, but only in the event that sending the person away would not lead to his or her destruction.

2. A cosmopolitan society will emerge naturally.

Kant's teleological approach assumed that there is a certain point of destination that is inevitable and that nature has already pre-determined the course of humanity. Kant argued that a cosmopolitan society is the point of destination, and by his logic, it cannot be prevented because it is nature's will. In Kant's fifth proposition of his Cosmopolitical Plan, he argued that "natural impulses" urge humanity to establish "a universal Civil Society founded on the empire of political justice" (4). He believed that finding a solution to the establishment of this society will be the highest problem for the Human Species, but that a solution is inevitable. Additionally, in his paper on Perpetual Peace, Kant discussed how marriage between states is frequently used as a method of achieving peace within a region (109). He argued for the cooperation between states and an end to war, not because it is right, but because it makes the most sense from a logical standpoint. This implies that humanity will naturally forge alliances in order to keep peace.

3. The individual will benefit most from sacrificing some personal freedoms in order to join a global cosmopolitan community.

Kant believed that individuals must make concessions and sacrifice rights, power, and resources in order for society to function and for man to be more successful in the long run. Kant explained, “in becoming a member of this community, each gives the other the security he demands” (“Perpetual Peace”: 119). Kant believed that man would use both his rationale and his morals to realize that self-interested individualism will be defeated. He also argued that man, by nature, is not capable of being entirely self-sufficient and needs others in order to find direction. Kant wrote about greed on a national scale, explaining that “the accumulation of treasure” is negative because it becomes a basis of conflict (“Perpetual Peace”: 111). Similarly, a society with great inequality will be a less stable society. The wealthier or more powerful must make concessions to the less privileged groups in order to uphold a successful society, which will bring them greater security and prosperity in the long term. However, Kant also recognized the benefits of competition. He used the example of trees in a forest to illustrate his point: each tree desires to become tallest and access the most air and sun, and with every tree feeling this same way, all trees work to grow tallest “and thus attain a fine erect growth” (“Universal History”: 5). From this we can infer that, in cities, immigrants will compete for resources and success, and therefore, become a stronger community as a whole. Additionally, immigrants tend to be more entrepreneurial, thus fostering this benign competition that leads to social improvement.

Analysis of case

The immigrant community in Baltimore and the work of the Esperanza Center has showed evidence of emerging cosmopolitan ideals within the city. When asked about recent changes that have occurred within the Esperanza Center, Diana Siemer, Educational Services Manager, explained that the Center’s profile has risen significantly within the last year, which has lead to an increase in funding, two additional staff members, and a new afterschool program for immigrant youth. She explained, “We began to be able to kind of ride on the coat tails of public sentiment towards Latino children and then by extension Latino adults and by extension immigrants” (Siemer). She explained that the increase in undocumented minors led to an increase in public sentiment towards her clients.

This is demonstrative of Kant’s belief that human beings have a moral duty to promote peace and live as global citizens. One way to promote such peace is to care for all members of our community, regardless of their background. If we are all to function as global citizens the way Kant predicted, nationality and background will begin to have less and less meaning, as we will accept that we are all part of a global community and therefore must care for one another. Many of the immigrants living in Baltimore who are clients of the Esperanza Center come from nations that are experiencing grave violence, particularly related to gang and drug activity. In addition to the violence, many citizens of

these countries suffer from economic hardship that can lead to lack of health care, water, food and sanitation, which is equally, if not more, destructive. According to Kant's universal right to visitation of foreign lands mentioned earlier, the morally correct thing is to accept these foreigners and not turn them back to a dangerous situation.

However, Kant also believed that the individuals within this global community must learn to maintain their distinctions. Baltimore is certainly no global cosmopolis at this time, but the transition is occurring. As Baltimore begins this transformation, the Esperanza Center is now, more than ever, at the forefront of conversations and is receiving recognition for the important work it does in assisting immigrants with their transition to life in Baltimore.

So far the Esperanza Center has had much success with these efforts. As of March 2015, nearly 100% of unaccompanied minors at the Esperanza Center were reunited with their families (Siemer 2015). Baltimore as a whole is working to open its hearts and homes to this new population. Mayor Stephanie Rawlings-Blake's welcome initiative for new immigrants in Baltimore is in part to "create an environment where all cultures, ethnicities, and races feel welcomes and that everyone can call home" ("Mayor Rawlings-Blake" 2015). Not only does this city want immigrants to live in Baltimore, but also it wants them to feel comfortable celebrating their culture and individuality within the community.

It is a little more difficult to find concrete evidence in Baltimore of Kant's point that a cosmopolitan society will emerge naturally. However, we can look to examples of the demographic changes within the city to see that we are naturally moving towards more diversity. As the city gradually becomes more multicultural, it appears that a natural shift is occurring towards a cosmopolis. "In 2010, the Census recorded a total of 44,000 foreign-born people living in Baltimore – 7 percent of the population and more than double the number living here 20 years ago" (Scola).

According to Diana Siemer, no more than 5 years ago, it appeared that students were just passing through her classes and that her client base was different from week to week. To her, this exemplified a fluid immigrant population that wasn't settling in the city. Today, Siemer notes that many of her students are the same week after week; these immigrants are permanently settling in the city and forming "cornerstones...foundations of community" (Siemer 2015). Today, immigrants are viewed as community members rather than just passers-by. This is a large step in the formation of a cosmopolitan society.

A highly functioning society naturally responds to needs that are presented. Baltimore is demonstrating its willingness and ability to respond to the influx of immigrants. In 2008, Carmalyn Dorsey, a community health educator at Johns Hopkins began taking her students to the Esperanza Center to work with immigrant families. During their home visits, they discovered that there were many underlying causes of health concerns: lead paint in the homes, housing structures that were deteriorating, lack of safe footwear, etc. These students worked with landlords, churches, hospitals, and other organizations to advocate for the creation of new services and to connect immigrants with various resources. Ever since then, Hopkins sends a new team of nursing students for an extended period of

time twice a year to the Esperanza Center to assist in healthcare efforts for the immigrant community (Dorsey). As the need within Baltimore continues to grow, the city will respond and the Esperanza Center will remain a point of connection.

The third point by Kant is that we must sacrifice personal freedoms in order to achieve success in a global cosmopolitan society. It's important to remain realistic in our perception of Baltimore's move towards cosmopolitan ideals. Although it's wonderful to see how welcoming and caring Baltimoreans have been to the immigrant population, their motivation to accept a new community is additionally self-serving. We can see evidence of this is the way people promote the immigrant community and speak supportively towards immigrants. For example, Mayor Rawlings-Blake's new initiative to welcome immigrants focuses on how they will help Baltimore economically (Abell Foundation 2014). Her method is to convince Baltimore natives that bringing immigrants to the city will be beneficial to the current locals.

The mayor and her team implemented a program called Welcoming Baltimore that used similar tactics to convince locals to open their communities to immigrants. Rawlings-Blake explains that immigrants will bring valuable knowledge and skills to the city, thus allowing us to learn and grow with them ("Mayor Rawlings-Blake" 2015). Diana Siemer explains that many Fells Point locals have been very pleased to have immigrants living in the neighborhoods because they work hard and accept lower pay than many Baltimore locals, allowing Baltimore businesses to thrive. The fact that we are looking at immigrants from the perspective of "how can they help us?" is demonstrative of Kant's argument. We, the City of Baltimore, are willing to sacrifice some of our cultural and language homogeneity, our land, and our resources to immigrant populations because it will benefit us in the long run. We will all move together towards a cosmopolitan society because we need one another.

This gradual shift towards a society that reflects certain elements of cosmopolitanism will affect the role of the Esperanza Center in the future. Diana Siemer predicts even more regularity with the Center's client base in the future as more immigrants settle permanently in the city and use the Center to learn English and connect to other services. Siemer also noted that there are more female clients now than in the past and this will increase even more as families settle here permanently because children will be enrolled in the school system, giving mothers more free time during the days. The recent influx of undocumented minors has made some changes to the Center as well, namely an increase in funding. As stated earlier, the undocumented minors have brought more attention to the immigrant population, and because of this, the Center was able to find funding for their services. As a result, the Esperanza Center has been able to form new programs and hire new staff members (Siemer). The Center also recently hired a nurse practitioner and began offering dental care to clients as well (Dorsey). Programs will only continue to expand as immigrants continue entering Baltimore.

Conclusion

We cannot conclude that Baltimore City is an established local translation of a global cosmopolis. However, changes beginning to occur within the city reflect some of Kant's predictions. We are seeing a large influx of immigrants into the city and a mostly welcoming native population that is ready to receive them. As the city recognizes that inviting immigrants into local communities is moral, logical, and beneficial to society as a whole, we can expect to see smaller moves towards cosmopolitanism. Looking forward, the Esperanza Center's role will most likely expand in the city. Diana Siemer would love to see an expansion of the Center to better serve a larger client base. She already has some ideas in mind for programs in the future, such as career specific English classes. In order to better include immigrants in the works of the city, Carmalyn Dorsey recommends that immigrants who have been living in the city for longer begin to play more of a role in welcoming newer populations. She believes in bringing immigrant communities together to complete projects, such as making health manuals or to have parents give presentations and run workshops for other community members. As the city becomes more multicultural and utilizes the strengths of each member of society, Kant's ideal of cosmopolitanism might not be too far away.

References

- The Abell Foundation. (2014). *The Role of Immigrants in Growing Baltimore*. Baltimore, MD.
- Dorsey, Carmalyn. Telephone interview. 15 May 2015.
- "Esperanza Center." Esperanza Center. Catholic Charities, n.d. Web. 20 Mar. 2015.
- "Inter Kant.": *Cosmopolitan Right (I)*. N.p., n.d. Web. 15 May 2015
- Kant, Immanuel. *Perpetual Peace*. New York: Liberal Arts, 1957. Print.
- Kant, Immanuel. "Idea of a Universal History on a Cosmopolitan Plan." (1784): n.pag. Web.
- "Lecture 5: Universalising the rights of man: Kant's cosmopolitan point of view." (n.d.): n.pag. University of Warwick. Web.
- "Mayor Rawlings-Blake Announces Baltimore Welcoming Week." Stephanie Rawlings-Blake, Mayor. City of Baltimore. n.d. Web. 20 Mar. 2015.
- Scola, Nancy. "The Rise of the New Baltimoreans." National League of Cities. National League of Cities. N.d. Web. 20 Mar. 2015.
- Siemer, Diana. Personal interview. 13 March 2015.

2

The Role of ESOL Education in the Integration of Central American Immigrants into the Baltimore Area

Anna Kearns

Introduction

With the rise of globalization greatly facilitating movement across national borders, numerous changes have come about in the provision of public goods at the national and regional levels. Among them, the influx of immigrant children has changed the face of instruction in schools. This demographic change has heightened the need for English as a Second Language (ESOL) education, as many students enrolling in public schools have no prior experience with the English language. This case study focuses on an ethnically-diverse school, Oakland Mills High School (OMHS), a part of the Howard County Public Schools System, in order to analyze the direct effects of the changing local demographics on the ESOL program and, in turn, on an increasingly globalized school community. Since it is a high school, the case study focuses on children that immigrate to the United States at the age of fifteen or older with little to no prior knowledge of English. I use theoretical approaches to globalization to analyze not only the school's transformation, but also the effects this education has on the children, with respect to their prospects for the future and their identity as global citizens. I apply the approach to globalization formulated by historian Fernand Braudel. Using his concept of a hierarchically organized world-economy, I contextualize the immigration of students' families as an effort at upward social mobility from the periphery, their home countries in Central America, to the core, Baltimore, United States. I show how this process is aided by the language education of the OMHS ESOL program. Additionally, I apply the approach to globalization of sociologist Ulrich Beck, whose framework of methodological cosmopolitanism can help explain the identity creation process stimulated in the children by the ESOL program's efforts to build the immigrants' intercultural skills and cosmopolitanism, ultimately helping students become global citizens.

The main data utilized in this case study derives from an interview held on March 18, 2015 with an OMHS ESOL teacher, Mrs. Diana Thesing. This interview serves as the source of the viewpoint of the school and the ESOL program itself. The interview also serves as an indication of the changes the institution has undergone as a result of this surging immigrant population. A second interview, carried out on April 28, 2015 with three ESOL students - Gabriela and Camila, from Mexico, and Carolina, from El Salvador - supplements the analysis of the program with the viewpoint of the students' economic situations and perspectives on their ESOL education. Additionally, academic literature regarding sociocultural approaches to ESOL education is integrated into the case study in order to provide a further analysis of the classroom approach adopted by the program.

Theoretical approach

Fernand Braudel (1984) presented an approach to globalization that hinges on the idea of the world-economy as the chief globalizing sphere of human activity. Due to Braudel's conception of a world-economy as a single division of labor—an idea he borrowed from Immanuel Wallerstein—the modern world system consists of a single world-economy. While he distinguishes four types of flows and networks that comprise four different, yet overlapping, types of globalization, the present analysis will focus mainly on economic globalization. Braudel's emphasis on flows and networks can help understand the movement of people across space in the hierarchy of the world-economy. Those in the periphery, e.g. Central America, are economically overpowered by those in the core, or dominant capitalist center, e.g. the United States, where Baltimore is located. This inequality is a result of exploitation and exclusion, and encourages the flow of people from the periphery to the core. In this case study, Braudel's approach will be applied to analyze the flow of the immigrant children, and in some cases their families, who attest to coming to the United States, more specifically Baltimore, in order to create a better life for themselves. This systematic flow of people represents a system that cannot be understood within methodological nationalism, as those who make up this flow are clearly crossing their country's borders. Rather than limiting their economic viability to national boundaries, the students and their families try to take advantage of global opportunities. The consistent belief, shared among the immigrants, that the United States holds more promising economic prospects speaks to the potency of the ingrained concept of a dominant capitalist center, and the place of that dominant center within a hierarchy that exists on a global scale. The attractiveness of cities with global connections, such as Baltimore, proves a powerful motivating factor in deciding where to relocate in order to capitalize most efficiently on economic prospects within the hierarchical systematization of the world-economy.

Hailing the arrival of a “second modernity,” Ulrich Beck (2008) emphasized the existence of interrelatedness and interdependence of people in all corners of the globe. Along with this interdependence, Beck argued, comes increasing inequalities on a global scale. This thought mirrors Braudel's conception of the hierarchy of the world-economy. Attributing these new global phenomena to “cosmopolitanization,” Beck attested to the blurring of clear political, economic and cultural borders. Braudel also argued that this occurrence necessitates the recognition of equivalence across ‘horizontal’ differences. Likewise, Beck introduced the framework of methodological cosmopolitanism, which emphasizes the shared “global common denominators,” rather than drawing attention to the fragmentation of the world. Beck did not argue that borders have disappeared, but rather that they are becoming increasingly indistinct and permeable. Such an occurrence, Beck wrote, impacts “human identity construction” by moving away from the traditional “we versus them” dichotomy of identification towards the construction of a more global identity.

Cosmopolitanism allows for the active embrace of others based on the idea that this other is “fundamentally the same as ourselves” (795). At the same time, however, Beck argued against homogenization; he simply asserted that the walls between various communities be replaced by bridges (796). In this view, the flows and networks present in Braudel’s world-economy allow for the immigrants to more easily transcend national boundaries, increasing the validity of Beck’s methodological cosmopolitization. In emphasizing shared identities and values, this sense of unity allows for emphasis in the school community on the similarities, rather than on the differences, between ESOL students and their American peers. This cosmopolitization, however, underscores growing inequalities in a global space, which accounts for the reasoning behind the students’ migration in the first place.

Analysis of case

Having expanded threefold just throughout 2014, the English as a Second Language Program at Oakland Mills High School undoubtedly speaks to globalizing tendencies in the Baltimore area. Since the program first started twenty years ago, it has experienced tremendous growth and demographic changes, according to ESOL teacher Diana Thesing. Recently, the school has been receiving teenage boys who made an arduous journey from El Salvador and Honduras, almost always by themselves, in search of better job opportunities and education that they were not afforded due to the tumultuous conditions in their home countries. These new students display low achievement in academics in their native language due to gaps in formal education coupled with low education in general. They have been separated from their parents and families because their parents abandoned them or were killed due to the turbulent conditions, a reality that has led many of these students to leave, fleeing drug related gangs and violence (Thesing 2015).

As the school adapts to support an increasingly international community with special needs, the ESOL program has had to continually recreate itself to serve this changing population. Over the year of 2014, the program instructors have felt the need to adjust their teaching methods to better serve their current students. These adjustments have entailed rethinking their previous methods, timing and expectations. Assignments, for instance, are done exclusively in class to adjust for the students’ inability to complete them at home due to the absence of a well-developed understanding of the English language along with the absence of assistance at home.

Drawing from various theoretical approaches regarding globalization, the global dimensions of this case that would warrant analysis include the role of the program, intentional or not, in supporting the formation of a cosmopolitan identity in the students and the other members of the school community. Additionally, the case shows a clear movement of people into the Baltimore area, which is ultimately what creates this globalizing trend in the ESOL program and the school as a whole, and can be analyzed using the concept of flows in globalizations.

Fernand Braudel's *The Perspective of the World*, the third volume in his *Civilization and Capitalism* series, can be used to outline and explain the globalizations experienced by the ESOL program, thereby allowing for further analysis of the multidimensionality of the globalizing processes affecting the program. In his book, Braudel alluded to the creation of a social order in a world-economy, arguing that no society is without a social hierarchy that structures it, and that any given social system adapts to economic conditions (1984: 63). Approaching the case from this vein, one can see that the current conditions in Central America, lacking a developed economic structure, have faltered socially. Applying the concept of flows and networks to such an event, it is clear that these increasing flows of people can be attributed to the search for upward social mobility and economic stability, with such movement constituting a sole event within larger conjunctures and an even larger, overarching hierarchical structure. All of the girls I spoke with cited the hope for a better life that they and their families' felt the United States would offer them when contemplating the move from their home countries. Much of this hope derived from the potential to earn more money working in the United States, a conception related to the idea of the United States as the dominant capitalist center and of Baltimore as a globalizing city.

With immigrants comprising 12% of the population of the United States, half of which come from Latin America, the flow from the 'global south' to the industrialized north is well established (Harris 2013). Most immigrants cite economic opportunity as their reasoning behind uprooting to come to the U.S. (Martin 2013: 133). Statistics have indeed shown that the economic status of immigrants who come to the United States from Latin America improves after five years of residency in the country, when their wages move to above-poverty level from below-poverty level (Harris 2013). The subsequent decline in economic status for migrants who choose to return to Mexico speaks to why the ESOL students at OMHS overwhelmingly do not plan to return to their home countries (Harris 2013). The girls interviewed agreed they had more promising economic prospects in the United States, and thus did not speak of returning home. Rather, in many of their cases, the goal was to have additional family members come join them here in the United States, since several migrated without parents or siblings and ultimately settled in the Baltimore area because of family connections and promising economic opportunities. This movement meshes with Braudel's theory in that it frames the world in the perspective of a world-economy and speaks to the power this world-economy wields as the chief globalizing sphere of human activity.

In his piece *Reframing Power in the Globalized World*, Ulrich Beck spoke to a changing world in terms of boundaries, arguing that the disintegration of boundaries will lead to the breakdown of the conceptual interpretation of the world via the "national outlook" (2008: 793). The case of OMHS suggests that the beginning of such a breakdown may be taking place, as seen in the teaching methods and self-proclaimed values held by the ESOL program and its instructors. In an interview held at the school, Mrs. Thesing spoke to the increasing number of immigrant students as a sign of increasing interdependence, citing the idea of a shrinking world. While she framed her thought in terms of the traditional

nation-state paradigm, alluding to the social values held by citizens of various countries, she did speak to the concept of world values tying these distinctive countries together. Emphasizing the work the ESOL program does to highlight these values, Mrs. Thesing and the program arguably could be seen as contributing to the further development of the “second modernity” Beck outlined in his work (Beck 2008: 794). She recognizes the cultural and social differences as horizontal differences, without labeling one culture’s values as superior to another. Integrating this approach into its teachings, the ESOL program recognizes the classroom through a lens that can be analyzed using the work of renowned critically applied linguist Alastair Pennycook. Dr. Pennycook’s piece, “The Social Politics and the Cultural Politics of Language Classrooms” (2000), posits classrooms as “permeable spaces,” rather than isolated entities. He argued that classrooms serve as an intersection between local conditions and the social and cultural politics of communities. In this vein, the OMHS ESOL program’s approach recognizes the aspects of the learning environment as being culturally motivated, and seeks to embrace all cultures equally, rather than favoring one over another. In doing so, the teachers not only teach a lesson of acceptance within the classroom, but also provide a lesson that is easily applicable to the outside world, seeing as the macro dimensions of society and culture intersect both within and outside of the classroom. This intersection contributes to Beck’s second modernity and the interdependence of people across the globe, shown in the microcosm of the Baltimore area.

In applying the concept of a “second modernity” to the case, one can see that the students indeed avoid the “confrontational dichotomy of ‘we’ and ‘them’” in visualizing their identities, instead relating to a mix of cultures when defining themselves (Beck 2008: 794). Mrs. Thesing asserts that the ESOL students do not see the United States as superior to their own cultures, but rather as a world of opportunity. The values supported by the ESOL program’s educational goals further support this idea of integrating the students’ own preexisting cultural values with those that are present in American culture, as opposed to supporting purely American values. In having developed such values, the program has undoubtedly shown an understanding of the importance of cultural diversity, yet managed to support the integration of values that were, prior to this “second modernity”, seen as inherently different and distinct.

Conclusion

The English as a Second Language Program at Oakland Mills High School in Columbia, Maryland embraces its role as a tool to not only help immigrant children prepare for the workforce, but also for them to construct identities as global citizens. The students, most of who immigrated to the United States because of economic motives, embody the flows and networks laid out by Fernand Braudel in his theory regarding globalization. A hierarchically organized world-economy has a dominant capitalist center, manifested in several globalizing cities, one of which is Baltimore. By participating in the ESOL program,

the immigrant students gain the language skills necessary to fully participate in the U.S. labor force. At the same time, the ESOL program works to develop global identities in the students, helping them reconcile differences between their sociocultural background and that of the Baltimore area, drawing on the global common denominators that the different cultures share. Thus, similarities are drawn between the students and their local peers. Rather than being ostracized, the newcomers can more ably connect with the people and the culture that surrounds them. Such global citizenship is indicative of Beck's "second modernity," which is marked by an increasing interdependence of people across the world, but also by growing inequalities in a global space, as represented in Braudel's concept of a hierarchically structured world-economy.

References

- Beck, Ulrich. 2008. "Reframing Power in the Globalized World." *Organization Studies* 29:5, 793-804.
- Braudel, Fernand. 1984. *Civilization & Capitalism, 15th-8th Century: The Perspective of the World*. London: Williams Collins Sons & Co Ltd.
- Harris, William. 2013. "Immigration among Latin American countries fails to improve income." *UChicago News*. <http://news.uchicago.edu/article/2013/02/21/immigration-among-latin-american-countries-fails-improve-income>.
- Martin, Philip L. 2013. "Migration and US economic competitiveness." *Migration Letters* 10 (2). Academic Search Complete, EBSCOhost. <http://eds.b.ebscohost.com/eds/pdfviewer/pdfviewer?sid=2b83f6a3-97f1-40c0-88ac-25461314efb8%40sessionmgr113&vid=3&hid=113> (Accessed May 7, 2015).
- Pennycook, Alastair. 2000. "The Social Politics and the Cultural Politics of Language Classrooms." In *The Sociopolitics of English Language Teaching*, eds. Joan Kelly Hall and William G. Eggington. Clevedon: Multilingual Matters Ltd, 89-103.

3

Globalization and the Conservationism of Baltimore's National Aquarium

Matthew Knauer

Introduction

Established in 1979, the National Aquarium in Baltimore boasts of being an institution dedicated to promoting conservation of the world's aquatic life and to educating visitors, students and volunteers from around the world about preservation and participation. Born as a result of then-Mayor William Donald Schaeffer's own preservation plan for the city, the National Aquarium continues to exemplify the ideal of preserving the world's ecological treasures in a time when economic globalization threatens their very existence. The aquarium itself is a microcosm of the world. Its exhibits feature environments from the Amazon Rainforest to Animal Planet Australia and the flora and fauna that accompany them show just how much global boundaries have dissolved (Aqua.org). Using several theories of globalization formulated by historian William McNeill and by sociologists Michael Mann, Ulrich Beck and Saskia Sassen, this case study will analyze how this local institution's mission reflects the interconnectedness of local and global systems as well as the challenges presented by globalization to the preservation of the natural environment. Data comes from articles from the Baltimore Sun archives and from an interview with Eric Schwaab, the Aquarium's Vice President of Conservation.

Theoretical approach: four perspectives on the environmental challenges of globalization

Scholars of globalization have touched on the impact of the world system on the natural environment. William McNeill suggested that massive population growth could lead to ecological catastrophe in the future (McNeill 2008: 8). He argued that humankind has always been in a state of globalization, starting from the point men learned to control fire and to dance. From there, language developed and humankind moved forward to the point at which we find ourselves now. Learning to control fire increased early humans' ability to manipulate the physical environment around them, and it has not stopped since (McNeill 2008). We have had such an impact on our physical world that whole climates are being affected by our actions. The rate of global sea level increases has doubled in the last decade to 34 centimeters, ten of the hottest years on record occurred in the last twelve years, the oceans are warming, the Arctic and Antarctic ice is melting at alarming rates, and ocean acidification caused by the absorption of carbon dioxide has increased by 30 percent since the Industrial Revolution (Climate.nasa.gov). However, to McNeill, impending ecological disaster is just another challenge for humans to overcome (2008). Developing from the evolution of dance and music was an environment of cooperation

and community that transformed humans into our current state: a species capable of long-term planning, problem-solving, and innovation, and that is unlikely to change in the future (McNeill 2008).

Contrary to McNeill's assertion that humanity is likely to be able to handle its environmental concerns, Michael Mann proposed the notion of a boomerang effect, in which globalization will eventually reach the world's capacity to hold it and come back into itself with devastating effects. Already, economic expansion has fueled a massive growth in global carbon emissions, threatening not only the environment, but also the continued existence of humanity (Mann 2013: 3).

Ulrich Beck, in his 2008 paper on power in the globalized world, argued that cosmopolitanism had led to a second modernity, globalization, in the twentieth century. Beck claimed that new normative precepts emerged from globalization, such as human rights and an increased focus on environmental issues shared by humanity on a global scale (Beck 2008: 794). Prior to the late-1960's, environmental issues were not given much thought in the political realm but as the world economy expanded and greenhouse gas emissions increased along with the destruction of natural environments, international nongovernmental organizations, such as Greenpeace, emerged due to the concern of global citizens committed to addressing the problems beyond their national realms (greenpeace.org).

Saskia Sassen theorized that there is a second set of global processes beyond the creation of international institutions that are localized in nature in both national and subnational contexts. These processes are trans-boundary and connect national and subnational institutions and actors without going through the formal interstate system and they are promoting new normative principles such as environmentalism (Sassen 2008: 3).

These four perspectives are the foundation from which I analyze how the National Aquarium's conservationist efforts impact (and are impacted by) globalization.

Analysis of case

Finding a place on the spectrum

Eric Schwaab, the current Vice President of Conservation of the National Aquarium, came to the organization two years ago, after running the National Marine Fisheries Service for the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Organization (NOAA). Intrigued by the prospect of conveying the knowledge and work he accomplished there to a different audience, his current position tasks him with using the assets of the National Aquarium strategically in conservation actions outside of the Inner Harbor campus.

When examining the Aquarium, or institutions like it, and their missions, it is important to remember that they are also subject to economic pressures and that making money is key to continuing their conservation and research endeavors (even if the Aquarium is a non-profit institution). The Aquarium must juggle its attraction-based

agenda with its conservational and educational agendas. Schwaab explains that there is a spectrum in the industry: “At one end of the spectrum is all about making money ... [places] like SeaWorld you know, Ripley’s ... some of those commercial institutions. At the other end ... of the spectrum you would have almost like a pure conservation organization. And in the middle, or maybe toward that conservation organization side are institutions like the Wildlife Conservation Society which has the Bronx Zoo and the New York Aquarium but is also engaged in like really extensive environmental work all over the world doing a whole lot of research. You know, we sort of aspire to be more like that but we have a long way to go. (2015)”

In order to accomplish what can be conflicting goals at times, the Aquarium has emphasized creating a richer, more engaging experience for visitors. Their popular attractions, modeled after real-life environments, such as the Amazon rainforest, Australia, Atlantic reefs and others, lure guests in. Once inside, says Schwaab, the Aquarium introduces them to the global challenges that these environments face and educate them on the roles they can play to address their preservation, embodying Beck’s second modernity. Interestingly, when asked if exhibits were chosen based on level of degradation; in other words, did the Aquarium make an effort to represent the more endangered ecosystems in the world for sake of preservation; Schwaab said it was a mix. He admitted that a part of the process is figuring out what exhibits people are willing to pay money to see, and the other part was, again, providing a meaningful experience for guests. “At the same time people are here looking at neat animals, you want to engage them around the challenges those habitats face and what they can do to help,” said Schwaab (2015). The implication is that the Aquarium has chosen exhibits based on what people wanted to see, and people wanted to see environments that happened to be endangered. This suggests that the public has shifted to be an environmentally-conscious audience, consistent with the cosmopolitan set of values posited by Beck, and this is exemplified even more with one of the Aquarium’s most popular exhibits: dolphins.

How dolphins represent a shift in public values

In some ways, the saga of the dolphins mimics the change in public perception regarding animals in captivity and is a by-product of this new environmental awareness. Providing some historical context, Schwaab said that there is a belief that large mammals act as ambassadors for the institution to the audience, more so than small fish or other animals would. SeaWorld’s Shamu is an excellent example of this, as he, and the subsequent orcas that have taken the same name, are widely known throughout the country. The value of these animals acting as ambassadors, theoretically, is that the audience develops an attachment to them and that extends to a concern for the challenges they face in the wild. Therefore, they communicate with each other, create positive actions to address those challenges, and fulfill McNeill’s argument that we as a species are constantly coming up with innovations and solutions to address the problems we face.

However, despite this ambassadorial value, in 2012 the Aquarium ceased the popular daily dolphin shows in order to reduce the stress of the dolphins following the deaths of two calves in the previous year. Such a move ran counter to the generally accepted thinking of aquatic institutions that put substantial investment into flashy shows, yet it also represented the shift from exploitative showcases to a more relaxed environment that encourages more interaction with visitors, benefiting both the dolphins and guests (baltimoresun.com 2012).

It would be naive to assume the Aquarium went about these changes purely for altruistic reasons regarding the dolphins, even if that played a very large part. In 2014, a Baltimore Sun reporter, Dan Rodricks, who was critical of the implementation of dolphin shows back in 1990, wrote an article in which he posited that there is a new green generation: those under the age of 40, who grew up with messages about how to treat the environment and see the continued captivity and exploitation of animals for entertainment purposes as wrong. In response, the Aquarium is catering to that market. While Rodricks called the move smart, he acknowledged that the Aquarium has quite a ways to go to catch up to evolving world values; he further proposes that they expand their conservation efforts to the smallest of creatures, who are among the most endangered, and that they expanding their regional conservation projects along the Chesapeake Bay (Rodricks 2014).

Schwaab confirmed that public opinion did play a part in the transition from dolphin shows to a more interactive exhibit saying, “There’s clear data that, you know, the appreciation for and interest in coming to facilities like this for dolphin shows is on the decline. But even the acceptance of large, smart animals in captivity is also on the decline (2015).” If the dolphins’ job is to make a connection with people and bring them in but the people are less appreciative of that, then Schwaab says the Aquarium has to adapt to that (2015). This shift in public values has business implications as well, because if dolphin shows were originally started because people were willing to pay money to see them, and they are no longer willing, then that means something needs to change: “There’s a market component to this in addition to the animal care component that’s really important to us. It’s complicated because there is a lot of different dynamics at play,” Schwaab concluded.

The Aquarium’s role as a conduit between the local and the global

The Aquarium does not have an extensive conservational presence internationally, but they are making efforts locally by helping to clean up the harbor and the Chesapeake Bay. Schwaab described several initiatives that the Aquarium has put into motion or contributed to, including the planting of Atlantic white cedar trees on the southern Eastern Shore, the rehabilitation of local marshes, and the restoration of Poplar Island. The Poplar Island restoration project, in which a small natural dredge material site that is being turned into a larger artificial island using dredge material placement, has been particularly successful, gaining national and international attention, with Maryland and the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers and winning a “Coastal America” award for the achievement (menv.

com). In addition, says Schwaab, the Aquarium throws its influence into policy issues, supporting bottle and bag bills at the city and state level and endorsing the prohibition of shark fins. On the harbor, they have engaged with local groups such as Healthy Harbor Initiative and they are currently attempting to re-create their campus and turn it into a modern urban waterfront.

“So if you sat here and looked out at the place,” says Schwaab, “you know, 400-500 years ago, you’d see marshes, and trees right down to the water and that sort of thing. Now you look out and see, you know, something that’s better than it was in the seventies because of all the point-source pollution cleanup that has occurred in the watershed but you still see the environment that could be a lot better. And so, we’re trying to think about both technological improvements, like floating wetlands. We’re experimenting with these bio huts that are fish habitat structures that hang next to our piers. We’re looking at things like algae turf scrubbers, using algae to clean the water. So we’re thinking about how can we sort of not only live but demonstrate friendly environmental behaviors so maybe in forty or fifty years from now you look out and you still see places for people but you also see maybe more natural features, some floating wetlands, some trees and maybe some pockets [of] natural wetlands (2015).”

But what about global efforts? The Aquarium itself does not assert a large presence of boots-on-the-ground conservation efforts around the world, but they play a critical role in global conservation nonetheless. The National Aquarium has something valuable that other organizations engaging in conservation work want: access to an audience. While groups that the Aquarium partners itself with, such as the National Maritime Sanctuary Foundation, do the bulk of the conservation efforts, whether it be in Hawaii or Antarctica or Australia, the Aquarium then shares the solutions being implemented with local audiences in Baltimore, promoting education and stimulating action.

The Aquarium working with other sub-national institutions in a collaborative effort in which it presents the work being done by those organizations to its audience illustrates Sassen’s theory of a second set of processes of globalization that operate at subnational levels. By collaborating with likeminded institutions away from the bureaucratic nature of national governments, the Aquarium is able to extend its goals and abilities to act while simultaneously promoting and assisting other groups. This communication also embodies McNeill’s theory that communication is the key to overcoming collective human challenges.

Conclusion: the Aquarium going forward

While much is made in the media today over the lack of effective action to combat climate change, institutions like the National Aquarium have already begun to address the problem. Demonstrated through their conservationist efforts and educational endeavors, the Aquarium is doing its part to stem the impending ecological disaster brought on by rapid globalization, embodying what McNeill said: “... ingenuity and invention remain alive

among us as much as ever. So we and our successors may perhaps continue to stumble onward like all preceding human generations, meeting with painful disappointments and changing behavior accordingly, only to provoke new risks and meet fresh disappointments. That has always been the human condition, and seems likely to last as long as we do” (McNeill 2008:9).

Reflecting the expectations of both Sassen (about globalization on the subnational level) and of McNeill (about how humanity is likely to tackle global environmental problems), the Aquarium is able to highlight the work being done globally to a local audience while promoting local conservation actions. They are playing to the strengths they have at their disposal to effectively educate the public about global issues while still maintaining a local perspective. This is an effective strategy, because grasping an issue with such far-reaching global implications like environmental conservation is quite daunting. It often begs the question, “What can I do? How can I contribute to a problem that extends far beyond my street, my city, my country?” But by implementing local efforts that have seen measurable success, which depend on volunteerism and directly affect the public’s home, they have created (and responded to) a more globally aware audience.

The key to long-term success will be the Aquarium’s ability to continually adapt to the new world values displayed by its public. Eliminating dolphin shows demonstrated that they were serious about being a major player in conservation and preservation, and that they are in-tune to public demands. Schwaab touched on possible solutions going forward to keep the institution relevant, including possibly moving the dolphin population to a sanctuary setting on campus and replacing them with something else that will engage audiences and promote discussion and action. These are the sorts of decisions that will keep the Aquarium relevant to the local population, which will sustain their business model while simultaneously stimulating their research and conservation component. Continued engagement with both national and subnational organizations around the world will make the Aquarium a greater player in the global conservation scene, and in the next few decades it could become a national beacon of environmentalism. The Aquarium is in the forefront of the charge towards reversing or preventing Mann’s boomerang effect, employing McNeill’s reference to the human spirit of innovation to tackle the challenges our natural environment faces today.

References

- McNeill, W. H. 2008. “Globalization: Long-Term Process or New Era in Human Affairs?,”
New Global Studies 2:1, 1-9.
- Mann, M. 2013. *The Sources of Social Power* (Volume 4: Globalizations, 1945-2011). Cambridge:
Cambridge University Press
- Beck, U. 2008. “Reframing Power in the Globalized World,” *Organization Studies* 29:5, 793-804.
- Sassen, S. 2008. *Territory, Authority, Rights: From Medieval to Global Assemblages*. Princeton, NJ:
Princeton University Press.

National Aquarium. National Aquarium, n.d. Web. 18 Feb. 2015. <<http://www.aqua.org/>>

"Greenpeace." Greenpeace. Greenpeace, n.d. Web. 11 Mar. 2015. <<http://www.greenpeace.org/usa/en/>>.

Rodricks, Dan. "Getting a greener generation to buy into the aquarium." The Baltimore Sun (May 27, 2014)
http://articles.baltimoresun.com/2014-05-27/news/bs-md-rodricks-0527-20140527_1_marine-mammal-pavilion-national-aquarium-baltimore-aquarium

"Paul S Sarbanes Ecosystem Restoration Project at Poplar Island." Maryland Environmental Service. Maryland Environmental Service, n.d. Web. 13 May 2015. <<http://www.menv.com/pages/outreach/poplar.html>>.

National Marine Sanctuary Foundation. National Marine Sanctuary Foundation, n.d. Web. 13 May 2015.
<<http://nmsfocean.org/>>.

"Global Climate Change: Evidence." Climate Change: Vital Signs of the Planet. NASA, n.d. Web. 15 May 2015.
<<http://climate.nasa.gov/evidence/>>.



4

The Associated: Globally Engaging the Baltimore Jewish Community

Arielle Erenrich

Introduction

This case study will rely on theoretical approaches to globalization grounded in the discipline of sociology to examine how a Baltimore-based organization, The Associated, connects Jews living in Baltimore to the larger Jewish community around the world. Theories will come from the following readings: *Reframing Power in the Globalized World* by Ulrich Beck, and *Territory Authority Rights* by Saskia Sassen. Key elements of the sociological approach include Sassen's theory of globalization through subnational structures, and Beck's theory of cosmopolitanization. The Associated is a civil society organization in Baltimore that works to promote, enrich, and sustain Jewish life. It works with community partners in Baltimore, Israel and Poland, among other places. This organization provides funding to other groups and sponsors its own programs and events around Baltimore. As a faith-based organization, The Associated focuses its efforts on improving the Jewish community and working with other Jewish organizations. The Associated is an example of a local organization participating in the global Jewish community. The Associated connects Jews in Baltimore to Jews around the world by building partnerships with specific communities. Some of their existing programs include the Baltimore-Ashkelon Partnership, the Baltimore-Odesa Partnership, and the Marlene and Steward Greenbaum Volunteer Center in Ashkelon, Israel. According to its website, the Baltimore-Ashkelon Partnership was founded in 2003 and "The Partnership offers both Ashkelonim and Baltimoreans opportunities to explore Jewish identity and volunteerism together." Over 1,000 Baltimoreans and Israelis participate each year ("The Baltimore-Ashkelon Partnership"). The goal of the Baltimore-Odesa Partnership is "to advance revitalization of Jewish life in Odessa and to build relationships between our two communities" (Baltimore-Odesa Partnership Facebook page). The Marlene and Steward Greenbaum Volunteer Center was created in 2011 and is the central location for volunteering in Ashkelon ("Caring for Jews Around the World"). In addition to using the organization's websites as data sources, this case study relies upon an interview with Mary Haar, the Director for Israel and Oversees at The Associated.

Theoretical approach:

While structures like the inter-state system and the world economy are examples of large-scale globalization, smaller organizations that work with special communities in specific localities can still play a role in fostering globalization. Sassen examines the ways in which globalization occurs at the national and subnational levels. Globalization on the

subnational levels takes place below national governments and inter-state treaties, but it is not necessarily related to or directed by them. A subnational entity concerns itself with issues that are smaller in scope than the governance, economy, or military power of states, because they are not powerful enough to make a large impact. Instead, subnational organizations deal with individual issues or communities, often partnering with other similar organizations or government programs. However, their operations can partially respond to a global logic and global agendas. Sassen draws on the examples of “cross-border networks of activists engaged in specific localized struggles with an explicit or implicit global agenda” (Sassen 2006: 3). In this example, individuals can unite around a cause and move to wherever that cause is located in order to support it under the rule of national governments and across national boundaries. The ability of a particular cause to bring people together can be stronger than state borders. Sassen validates this claim by stating that “what makes these processes part of globalization even though they are localized in national, indeed subnational, settings is that they are oriented towards global agendas and systems” (Sassen 2006: 3). There is a rise in the importance of international ideas and these ideas have the power to bring people together. As members of civil society organizations work together to advance their own causes, they also become aware of other organizations that might endorse, or benefit from, their work, and then reach out to them. Sassen recognizes this process when she states “the epochal transformation we call globalization is taking place inside the national to a far larger extent than is usually recognized. It is here that the most complex meanings of the global are being constituted” (Sassen 2006: 1). She backs up this claim by emphasizing the importance of the work done at the subnational level; “a good part of globalization consists of an enormous variety of micro-processes that begin to denationalize what had been constructed as national” (Sassen 2006: 1). As a result, subnational organizations are imperative for the globalization process because they “reorient particular components of institutions and specific practices – both public and private – toward global logics and away from historically shaped national logics” (Sassen 2006: 2).

According to Beck, the larger process of globalization “means reinventing borders” (Beck 2008: 799). In other words, boundaries separating territories into states are becoming less important as more and more communities, businesses, and individuals interact with people in different parts of the world. As a result, governments, and states themselves, are becoming less significant in how people interact in the world. This also affects how an individual might formulate their identity. States are still important, however, because they maintain the capitalist structure of the world’s economy.

Beck writes about the cosmopolitanization, or the process of creating a cosmopolitan community. Cosmopolitanization refers to “the erosion of clear borders separating markets, states, civilizations, cultures, life-worlds of common people and its consequences: the involuntary confrontation with the alien other all over the globe.” (Beck 2008: 794). In other words, “the walls between them must be replaced by bridges” (Beck 2008: 795). In addition to seeing the differences between people, cosmopolitanization is

the process through which people recognize their differences and look for similarities. Instead of isolation, there is a quest for understanding. Through these direct interactions, people have the ability to look for existing connections created through a shared religion as well as understand the differences that exist and how they came to be. The process of cosmopolitanization “influences human identity construction which need no longer be shaped by the opposition to others, in the negative, confrontational dichotomy of ‘we’ and ‘them’” (Beck 2008: 794). Through building relationships with others, a cosmopolitan person can stop seeing people from different backgrounds as foreign.

Analysis of case

The Associated was founded 100 years ago. It is part of the national federation system of 155 different Jewish communities around North America. As a member of the federation system, The Associated is obligated to give some of their funding to nongovernmental organizations overseas like the Jewish Agency for Israel (JAFI) and the American Jewish Joint Distribution Committee (JDC). JAFI and JDC are both service providers who work on the ground in various locations around the world. Other primary roles of The Associated include fundraising and community building, so other smaller and more specific agencies can concentrate their efforts on serving the community. In other words, The Associated is the city hall of the Jewish community in Baltimore, because it brings various different Jewish organizations together in the same place. Based on observations and information gathered from the interview, in the Baltimore community, the planning department thinks about different issues, for example, financial assistance for families, connecting to the next generation and getting them involved. Everything is a partnership between professionals who work at The Associated and volunteers. It relies on community members to help shape what the Jewish community should look like and work towards achieving that goal. Volunteers also sit on committees, giving The Associated their direct input about certain issues.

Members of the Baltimore Jewish community view The Associated’s contributions along a spectrum. There are people who are really invested in serving on multiple committees and holding leadership roles and then there are people who do not even recognize The Associated. The question of how to connect to the community and help them to understand The Associated’s role therein is one thing people who work there constantly think about. Of course, the level of familiarity with work done by The Associated and its branding depends a lot on where a person is situated within the Baltimore Jewish community, as the different denominations of Judaism expect different things.

Not only does The Associated connect Jews to each other around the Baltimore area, but it also works to connect Jews in Baltimore to Jews around the world through donating money and enacting programs. Approximately 24% of its annual fundraising campaign goes overseas, either to aid Jewish communities outside of the U.S., or to connect Baltimore’s Jews to the global Jewish community. Volunteers have some oversight as to

where this money goes overseas. One of the primary values of The Associated is that “all Jews are responsible for one another” despite the differences, including national territories and languages, between them (Haar 2015). The Associated has 250 community members involved in their four global committees that work with Israel, Poland, and other countries. Each committee has a grant making process that includes the following steps: submitting requests for grant proposals, reviewing the submitted grant proposals, and then determining which proposals to work on. Committee members often take group trips overseas to see the work they helped influence and how the investment from the Baltimore community has taken root. There are many trips to Israel and Ukraine to meet the people whose lives have been influenced by work done by JAFI and JDC, the partner organizations that use money donated by The Associated to provide social services overseas. In the last ten years, several people from Baltimore have chaired other international Jewish agencies. As a result of their work as volunteers for The Associated’s international committees, the people became familiar with the work done by similar international organizations and wanted to continue to pursue work for causes they believe in (Haar 2015).

The Associated has three main overseas partnerships: the Israel Engagement Center, the Baltimore-Odesa Partnership, and the Baltimore-Ashkelon Partnership. The Israel Engagement Center was created in partnership with JAFI three years ago. Its sole focus is to create new connections between Baltimore and Israel, Baltimoreans and Israelis. One way in which this occurs is through sending Baltimoreans to Israel and bringing Israelis into Baltimore’s Jewish community. The Baltimore-Odesa Partnership strives to make personal connections between members of both the Baltimore and Odessa communities. They work to find tangible ways to bring aspects of Judaism and community to Odessa, a place where neither of those things have been able to flourish in the past. One way in which these personal connections are forged is through the Baltimore-Odesa Partnership’s very active Facebook page. The last partnership is the Baltimore-Ashkelon Partnership, which creates parallel networks of people in two different countries and provides ways for them to interact frequently. The main byproduct of the Baltimore-Ashkelon Partnership is friendship between people who would not otherwise interact. The Associated uses grants to make this happen. When a children’s choir, formed of Israelis and people from the U.S., performed in New York, The Associated provided an opportunity for the children from Ashkelon to visit Baltimore and meet their U.S. counterparts. The children became friends (Haar 2015). Through facilitating travel and volunteer opportunities for Baltimore’s Jews, The Associated gives people a chance to interact with others who might otherwise remain nameless and faceless.

According to Haar, the Associated also works with Global Peoplehood to help Jewish communities outside of the partnerships listed above. Through grants, Global Peoplehood allows The Associated to assist vulnerable populations (ex: children at risk, immigrants to Israel, people needing to immigrate to Israel). A recent grant was awarded to a program helping Jews in Islamic countries leave situations of unrest and immigrate to Israel. Another grant was given to help communities in Europe respond to anti-Semitism.

This grant goes towards funding, and supporting, leadership training institutes. Additionally, The Associated supports Global Peoplehood through working with non-profits like the Jewish Agency for Israel and JDC. The Jewish Agency for Israel is an Israeli non-profit that focuses on connecting diaspora communities to Israel. They mostly concentrate on bringing young people, under the age of 34, to settle in Israel. Through the efforts of the Jewish Agency for Israel, the number of people emigrating from France and Ukraine has increased. In addition, the Jewish Agency for Israel provides social services to help recent immigrants adjust to their new lives in Israel. Lastly, JDC is an U.S. non-profit that has been around for 100 years. It focuses on rescue, relief, and renewal efforts and works closely with another non-profit, JAFI, to help with rescue work. JDC helps move displaced people to safer areas and provides social services to those people once they have moved. JDC also works to provide programming to displaced communities in order to help the people there coalesce into their own support system. JDC also created an initiative in Buenos Aires to make Judaism more prominent. This resulted in a Jewish cultural festival and public street art depicting Jewish themes. The work done by JDC, JAFI and Global Peoplehood promote the cosmopolitan ideas by crossing state borders in order to cooperate with other organizations that support Jews around the world and provide aid to those who need it.

The purpose behind forming these partnerships is to incorporate Baltimore into the web of international Jewish organizations and the global Jewish community they create. The Associated provides Jews living in Baltimore with direct, and indirect, links to Jews around the world. Indirect links include giving volunteers a voice in deciding how to distribute funding and reading through grant proposals for aid projects. Direct links include participation in programs made with one of their partners, trips to either Odessa or Ashkelon, and interacting with visitors from those places when they come to Baltimore. The Associated fulfills the role Sassen gives to subnational organizations because it works at the subnational level to connect Jews in one locality, Baltimore, to Jews in other localities. The Associated unites with other organizations, like JDC and JAFI, to further the causes of providing for the Jewish community around the world, regardless of state borders. The causes of Judaism and the strong belief in community drive The Associated to reach out across the globe. These smaller processes of including community volunteers in making decisions allows The Associated to help others make personal connections around the world.

A global Jewish identity has the ability to transcend the reach of state borders and governments. Jews around the world are able to connect to each other based on a shared system of beliefs and basic cultural values. One example of this global connection comes from Haar's experience while visiting Odessa with The Associated. In an interview, Haar recounts a meaningful part of the trip. "The first time I was in Odessa, I met a young woman; she was volunteering at JCC and she basically went to summer camp through the Jewish agency and really learned about being Jewish" (2015). Before going to summer camp, the girl did not know anything about being Jewish. Her parents could not tell her, because they had grown up unable to practice their religion and therefore did not know much about it.

“When she got to camp she saw there were some things that were familiar. Kids who went to camp are teaching their parents about what it means to be Jewish. And why.” She had dinner at the woman’s house. “To hear her parents say ‘we weren’t allowed to do these things when we were growing up, but our daughter was able to do that’” was a “really powerful” experience for Haar. Through meeting a person living in Odessa and hearing her story, Haar was able to form a personal connection between herself and another person from a different country. Haar could relate to the young woman on a multitude of levels. First, they interacted in person, sharing some experiences through The Associated’s trip to Odessa. Second, Haar saw how the work done by the organization she works for impacts lives in a positive way through bringing them opportunities to learn about and practice their religion, and then teach it to others. Third, Haar bridged the gap between cultures through seeing commonalities between herself and the young woman, the largest of which is their shared religion. In Beck’s analytical framework, Haar builds bridges between herself and another person, globalizing her own life and making her worldview more cosmopolitan. Mary is an individual example of Beck’s theory of cosmopolitanization. From Sassen’s perspective, The Associated can be considered a subnational organization operating under a global agenda. It exists underneath the sovereignty of national governments; it is not a state, nor does it interact with states, instead it works in various local communities at the individual level. The Associated can be seen as actualizing the effects of globalization by bringing it to individuals through accessible measures. It is easier for individuals within society to empathize with the work of subnational organizations than for them to internalize the meanings behind things like foreign direct investment.

Conclusion

In conclusion, sociological theories of globalization can be applied outside of the classroom to real life examples, like that of The Associated. Sassen discussed the importance of organizations, which work at the subnational level, filling in the gaps where the government cannot act and sometime following a global agenda. As a subnational organization, The Associated fills many gaps for the local and global Jewish communities. It fills local gaps by funding existing organizations and providing support for Baltimore’s Jewish population through programming and working with partner organizations. Most importantly, The Associated does something no state government can, it provides individuals with the ability to reach out to the global Jewish community and develop their own identities as cosmopolitan Jews. Through partnership programs and grants, The Associated connects Baltimore to a larger network of Jews that spans the world. The choices that this single organization and its supporters make have a global effect. This relates to Sassen’s claim that micro-processes happening at the subnational level are an important form of globalization. In the work of The Associated, Beck’s claims about cosmopolitanization are also validated as individual Jews in Baltimore connect with Jews in Odessa, Israel, and around the world fostering the creation of a global community.

Mary's time in Odessa suggests this because she was able to acknowledge "otherness as at the same time different and equal," which, according to Beck, is "the core meaning of cosmopolitanism" (Beck 2008: 794). Haar, and others who have participated in The Associated's efforts to connect Jews around the world are experiencing "cosmopolitan realism' ... the whole conceptual world of the 'national outlook' becomes disenchanting, that is, de-ontologized, historicized and stripped of its inner necessity." (Beck 2008: 793). Instead of seeing the world as divided between state borders and those out of the United States as being separated from her, Mary may now see the populations of Jews that she knows about. Her global Jewish identity allows her to see past territorial boundaries.

Future case studies of similar subnational organizations could help further understand how religious groups impact their target populations by bringing them closer to others who practice that religion around the world. The following questions should be answered: "How do other religious, or cultural, organizations do this and in what ways are they successful in adding to a global religious or cultural identity?" In addition, more research should be conducted, through a literature review, to see what scholars have said about transnational religious communities and global identities.

References

Beck, Ulrich. 2008. "Reframing Power in the Globalized World." *Organization Studies* 29 (May): 793-804.

Saksia, Sassen. 2008. "Introduction." In *Territory Authority Rights*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1-24.

Baltimore-Odessa Partnership Facebook page. https://www.facebook.com/BaltimoreOdessa/info?tab=page_info. 24 March 2015.

Mary Haar, personal interview, April 24, 2015, Atwater's, Catonsville, MD.

The Associated. "Caring for Jews Around the World". <https://www.associated.org/globalcommunity>. 24 March 2015.

The Associated. "The Baltimore-Ashkelon Partnership." <http://www.qmarkets.org/live/baltimore/home>. 24 March 2015.



5

Red Emma's Bookstore and Coffeehouse: Anarchism and Cosmopolitanism in Baltimore

Megan Critzman

Introduction

Cities and states often seek to be recognized on the international playing field as global. Their governments strive for this recognition by employing policies and initiatives. The importance of individual actors within national states, however, is often ignored in these larger efforts, and the local level actor experiencing globalization sometimes appears as insignificant. Globalization, nevertheless, works from within national states as well as through state-based initiatives, including international organizations. It can also be influenced at the micro-level, for instance, when participants work to make society more global and cosmopolitan. Red Emma's coffeehouse, a worker's collective located in Baltimore's Station North Arts and Entertainment District, is an actor in globalization that enables its customers and workers to adopt more cosmopolitan attitudes. To elucidate how Red Emma's promotes cosmopolitanism this case study will use Immanuel Kant's theory of cosmopolitanism" and philosophies of global citizenship. This case study will demonstrate that: 1) Red Emma's values and activities can be considered cosmopolitan in themselves, 2) Red Emma's values and activities enable its workers and customers to become cosmopolitan global citizens, and 3) Red Emma's values and activities can be modeled and adapted by other organizations to promote cosmopolitanism throughout American society. Red Emma's defines itself as a radical, anarchist space. This case study will argue that Red Emma's roots in anarchism form a preliminary foundation that supports cosmopolitanism. The concept of anarchism will help define the basis of the organization, with an emphasis on how specific collective actions can affect our larger everyday reality, in effect contributing to produce global citizens. Red Emma's online manifesto and an interview conducted with one of the current members of the workers' collective will be used to analyze the specifics of Red Emma's cosmopolitan work.

Theoretical approach:

In 1784, Immanuel Kant established a philosophy for cosmopolitanism in "Idea for a Universal History with a Cosmopolitan Purpose." Kant's cosmopolitanism states that over the course of human history, it is inevitable that rational and moral imperatives will defeat natural egoism. Rationalism is a function that is not instinctive but rather tentative through practice (Kant 1784). Kant claimed that as the human species evolves and deploys reason, a utopian state would emerge where cumulative learning will overtrump individualism, thus creating a global cosmopolis. This global cosmopolis, a concept derived out of Kant's cosmopolitanism, will consist of "citizens of the earth" rather than just citizens of

any one particular state (Kant 1784). The long-term goal of cosmopolitanism is seemingly meaningless and out of reach, but it must be understood as a series of generations working towards cumulative global awareness, which is dependent on the current generations continuous development of faculties such as reason and dialogue. Kant's cosmopolitical plan stresses the needed for consistent progression of reason and education.

Kant stressed that liberal education and a vibrant cultural life are essential to cosmopolitanism, and he argued that the arts and humanities contribute to the moral maturity necessary for peace and progression (Luncht 2009). Kant argued that art and sciences "make great headway against the tyranny of man's propensity to the senses, and so prepare him for a sovereignty in which reason alone is to dominate" (Luncht 2009: 312). Liberal education is important because it exercises the 'faculty' of reason rather than relying on the senses or natural instincts. Kant argues that "humanity means both the universal feeling of sympathy, and the ability to engage universally in very intimate communication. When these two qualities are combined, they constitute the sociability that befits our humanity" (Luncht, 2009: 312). Through the pursuit of liberal education that promotes universalism and dialogue, we can move towards global citizenship and a global cosmopolis.

The potential for a global cosmopolis, in addition to individual cognitive development, is also built on the presupposition that "the civil constitution of each state shall be republican" (Kant, 1795: 120). This is founded on the principle of "freedom of all members of society as human beings." Kant's idea also requires "dependence of all on common legislation." In a republic all members should have consensus on laws and adopt them as their own personal values. The power of an effective republic is that it has a "small staff of executive powers," meaning it is governed by fewer rulers, and these rulers focus on real representation of the people (Kant 1795). It does not grow upward in size, but keeps a horizontal structure, growing outwards based on consensus. Republican systems are representative, and a society in which citizens interests are accounted for must also have an interest in cultivating its citizens to their fullest rational capacity. Democratic or despotic systems focus on control and consolidation of powers, and therefore ignorance is often promoted or overlooked to keep manipulation levels of its people high (Kant 1795). Republican systems flourish when encouraging the liberal education of their peoples, and avoid despotism because their citizens are educated, involved in the system, and able to address its flaws.

Analysis of case

1. Red Emma's values and activities can be considered cosmopolitan in themselves.

A contemporary approach to cosmopolitanism must include higher attention to didactic community centers as a platform for individual exposure to global issues and viewpoints. Outlets are needed at the local level for individuals to find social justice

outreach groups in order to address the growing problems of current events and to practice cognitive awareness on a local as well as global basis through dialogue and education.

As an organization, Red Emma's values and activities are cosmopolitan in themselves. Red Emma's acts as a magnet for cosmopolitanism within the city of Baltimore. In their decade of existence, Red Emma's has relocated from a basement shop in the historic Mount Vernon neighborhood to the Station North Arts and Entertainment district of Baltimore. In their prior neighborhood, Mt. Vernon, the residents were predominantly white and affluent, and the organization catered to what a member of the collective in an interview called "older white liberals" (interview 05/07/15). In contrast to the previous neighborhood, their new location is rooted in a multiracial area, which encompasses a vast clientele who would not have previously been exposed to radical ideologies such as anarchism, workers cooperatives, and horizontalism. Red Emma's acts as a space to connect the multiple demographics of Baltimore. Their locations have changed and they have expanded, but the foundations of their politics remain the same: they continue to function as a worker-run collective run by consensus. The values they are committed to are: (1) Sustainability: as far as is possible, they try to minimize waste, and maximize recycling and reuse. Further, they are animal friendly, as they are a 100% vegetarian cafe, and focus extensively on our vegan menu; (2) Safe space: there is no room for racist, sexist, homophobic, transphobic, or ableist behavior in their space; (3) Support for the independent publishing ecosystem: as much as possible, they support non-corporate presses and distributors that share our values (Red Emma's 2015). Their values show consciousness to larger global issues that can be addressed at the local and individual level. The principles of nondiscrimination and respect for differences among individuals create an inclusive space that is cosmopolitan. Red Emma's also addresses sustainability and concern for the natural environment, which is a larger problem that is shared by humanity as a whole. As a customer and participant of Red Emma's you are exposed to multicultural perspectives and an exemplary anti-capitalist system, which functions on participatory democracy among workers rather than hierarchies led by capitalist actors.

2. Red Emma's values and activities enable its workers and customers to become cosmopolitan global citizens.

Red Emma's is a platform on which the citizens of Baltimore are able to enhance their status as global citizens. The values are based on sustainably sourced food and coffee, and the space serves as a safe space for dialogue and inclusion. During a customer's visit to Red Emma's, a person can expect to find fair trade coffee, which is roasted in store and sourced from Thread coffee, a local collectively-owned small-batch coffee roaster that ensures its coffee was grown and sold in a sustainable way for both farmers and the earth. Food options are local and organic when possible, entirely vegetarian, sometimes vegan, and can be adjusted to account for multiple food allergies. They sell local beer and vegan wines as well (personal observation by the author, 04/28/15). The book department has

an extensive array of alternative and non-corporate books, radical books, newspapers, magazines, and self-published zines. Red Emma's anti-capitalist values allow its patrons to read and sit in the cafe without purchasing the books beforehand, but they do ask that the books be re-shelved afterwards. Those visiting the store who have no prior knowledge of the ideologies behind Red Emma's can find signs of their radicalism, whether it is through questions of preferred dietary choices (dairy or nondairy), through Black Lives Matter hashtags on the windows, through questions of preferred gender pronouns to create an inclusive space, or through the bookstore which contains book categories such as Feminism and LGBTQ, IWW / Workers Rights, Organization and Activism, and many more that are not found in typical bookstores. When customers address these radical elements that they were not predisposed to, it can lead to self-reflection and to questions about personal ideologies.

The organization is defined as a safe and inclusive space for people in the Baltimore community to gather and discuss matters ranging from everyday conversations to current social justice issues. Red Emma's is not a political agency and does not mobilize people for social movements, but acts as a space that attracts Baltimore's social justice groups. It was used as an organizing center for the recent Black Lives Matter movement that gained momentum after the death of Freddie Gray, a black man who died in police custody in Baltimore. People came to Red Emma's and made protest signs and received information about upcoming marches and protests throughout the city. The organization also hosts many different social justice events, including the Social Justice Happy Hour. HollabackBmore, a gender conscious group that address street harassment in Baltimore, has taken advantage of such events and brings people together to have conversations that address patriarchy and sexism in society. These events allow consciousness-raising dialogues for people to question society's systemic inequalities and address how society can change through individual actions. These events allow for and showcase individual actions that address society's regressions into a system of inequalities preventing future generations from evolving naturally into a potential global cosmopolis.

Red Emma's offers weekly special events such as national and international book speakers, teach-ins, or panels. Recent topics have included police brutality in America ("Ferguson, The State of Black America, and Where do we go from here?"), feminist movements in Latin America (Hilary Klein's book talk on "Compañeras: Zapatista Women's Stories"), and many more that can be found on Red Emma's Facebook page. These events organized at Red Emma's are always free to the public. Red Emma's also hosts a sister organization - the Baltimore Free School. The Baltimore Free School exemplifies Kant's call for the liberal education of global citizens. As its name indicates, it is a free organization that offers classes to anyone. It is inclusive also because anyone can teach a class. They have registrations for classes that anyone can sign up for, which include weekly readings, but all are welcome to join mid-session, participate, and provide insights from readings or their own personal reflections. This didactic organization is both run by and attracts members of the community, exposing its students to different mindsets and viewpoints

that would have otherwise not been encountered in independent study. A community system of learning can better reflect the notion that “our conversation with texts enables us to enlarge, however imperfectly, the community of thinkers with whom we converse to include those remote from us in space and time” (Luncht 2009: 314). These events require dialogue and conversation between participants, reflecting Kant’s call for dialogue in the formation of making global citizens.

3. Red Emma’s values and activities can be modeled and adapted by other organizations to promote cosmopolitanism, thus making American society more cosmopolitan.

The Kantian republican model of governance is not exclusive to government systems; it can also be applied to businesses and other organizations to promote a more egalitarian society. Republics run on consensus and result in individuals influencing society, rather than a society controlled by a selected few. It is important that this model be adopted by other businesses and organizations because it redefines hierarchical structures and creates a platform of dialogue where everyone has a role in brainstorming and problem-solving. It promotes rational thinking and requires educated people to be concerned with how their actions contribute to larger global connections. When businesses and organizations adopt Kant’s republican model, self-governing through egalitarianism replaces capitalist hierarchies. When republican governance expands to businesses and organizations, then the notion of power and control radicalizes at the individual level, allowing for differing and more radical conceptions of government. Micro-level republics can be the building blocks to large-scale structural change that can spread to governments. Through an evolutionary process of individual development, progress is made toward a global cosmopolis.

Red Emma’s is an example of how consensus and horizontalism can reflect Kant’s call for a republic, on a state-level and individual moral basis. Red Emma’s is a model for other organizations to take note of because it runs as a worker’s cooperative, meaning “everybody who is a part of the collective owns an equal share of the business, and has an equal voice in the decisions we make to run it” (Red Emma’s 2015). This encompasses Kant’s call for small executive powers that require consensus of all members. Red Emma’s also stresses the importance of consensus stating it “is about treating people as valued equals, building the foundations of trust you need to take people seriously, to truly listen to what they have to say, and to work things out dialogically until arriving at a solution that everyone is comfortable with” (Red Emma’s 2015). Kant distrusted democratic systems of elected officials because they focus on the consolidation of power, rather than on true representation of the people. Red Emma’s does not use democratic representations because “traditional voting encourages factionalization, and a competitive attitude towards making decisions, where the goal is to get your way by overpowering the minority” (Red Emma’s 2015). After discussing the workers co-op in an interview, one of the members explained

that when people have differing opinions on matters, it is worked out through dialogue, and when both sides reach an understanding and agreement, then the rest of their meetings and decision-makings can continue (Interview 05/07/25).

Red Emma's is a model to other businesses and organizations because it exemplifies a method that engages, educates, and provides workers with rational thinking and decision-making that adds to their commitment to the organization. It is powered by anti-capitalist and radical ideologies and a horizontalism that allows equality between workers. All members have an equal starting wage, and the collective ensures that all receive a living wage. When discussing the organization structure with a member of the collective, they explained that the more work and hours a member is willing to put into the project is the agreed-upon fair way in which members earn wage increases (interview 05/07/15). Red Emma's is an egalitarian model that focuses on the well being of its workers and providing its customers with radical alternative information that would not normally be able available in the Baltimore community.

Red Emma's originated as an anarchist info shop, originally called Blank Planet, that sourced radical books and self-published zines to other anarchists in Baltimore. Blank Planet later changed the name to Red Emma's after anarchist Emma Goldman, who worked against state tyranny, capitalist exploitation, and patriarchal oppression. In an interview, a member commented that Red Emma's consciously evolved into a space that defines itself as radical, rather than just anarchist - though it still has its roots in such - in order to open its doors as a spot of inclusion, rather than creating a divisive political agenda (interview 05/07/15). Red Emma's believes that committing "to a label and a specific ideological tradition was unnecessarily limiting," although it is still rooted in philosophies of anarchism (Red Emma's 2015). Venues are an important aspect of anarchism and radicalism because they serve as a foundation for people to meet, discuss, and make decisions collectively. Anarchism has the potential to radicalize the individual because it is rooted in bottom-up grassroots struggles to create micro-level changes in everyday life - changes that are necessary for larger shifts in the macrostructure (Wigger 2013). Anarchism is different from other radical agendas because, unlike Marxism, it pursues preempted direct actions...to promote change in the immediate future, rather than a distant post-revolution future that is usually ascribed to Marxism (Wigger 2013). This philosophy is typically anti-state because state institutions are constructed of hierarchies and do not run on a system of egalitarianism.

Conclusion

This case study shows an example of the ways in which individual actors can play a role in shaping globalization. Kant looked at history as a web, a sum of human actions that builds society towards a global cosmopolis. It is a pleasant paradox that an anti-state ideology like anarchism can be applied to a potential global world order. This gives hope that the current state system under which our society functions can be repaired

from within. American society, founded on democracy, runs on the consolidation of power through selected representatives, and Kant believes that democracies are civil, but lack a republic's moral accountability to the people. When we take anarchist ideologies, such as the need for individual direct actions to confront injustices, whether that be radical conversations or participation in social justice groups, we are helping to construct a society where citizen's demands are heard and accounted for. Our level of cosmopolitan attitudes determines whether our individual actions are contributing to the progress or regression of society. These attitudes can be strengthened when we have sources of liberal education and dialogue. Red Emma's is a necessary resource for a city that needs global citizens who are informed and radical enough to challenge injustices and think outside the box of traditional capitalist hierarchies.

References

Kant, I. 1784. The Idea of a Universal History on a Cosmopolitical Plan.

Kant, I. 1795. Perpetual Peace: A Philosophical Sketch.

Lunct, M. (2009). Toward Lasting Peace: Kant on Law, Public Reason, and Culture. *American Journal of Economics and Sociology*, (1), 303

"Red Emma's. 2015. <https://redemmas.org/about>. Accessed on May 11, 2015."

Wigger, A., & Buch-Hansen, H. (2013). Competition, the global crisis, and alternatives to neoliberal capitalism: a critical engagement with anarchism. *New Political Science*, 35(4), 604-626.



6

YBI African Apparel and Fashion in Baltimore: an Anthropological Approach to a Small Globalized Business

Mbalou Camara

Introduction

In this day and age, many people wear certain articles of clothing in order to remain trendy and uphold popular modes of fashion by displaying brands. Others, however, use clothing as a means of ethnic identification and a symbolic way of embracing the values and beliefs behind a distinct culture. YBI African Apparel and Fashion (YBI) is a small business located in Baltimore, Maryland that highlights this very cultural notion behind clothing. According to Sister Yeshiyah B. Israel, owner and founder of the business, YBI aims to encourage more pride and joy in traditional Sub-Saharan African culture throughout the United States by selling a distinctive line of garb and accessories inspired by the African diaspora. In this paper, I analyze YBI's business from the perspective of Arjun Appadurai (2001) in "Disjuncture and Difference in the Global Cultural Economy" and of Jonathan Friedman (1995) in "Global System, Globalization and the Parameters of Modernity: Is Modernity a Cultural System?", who maintain that globalization embodies dynamic processes of culture and identity manifested in many settings of the world today. While Appadurai delineates the different "scapes" that accompany the global economy's complexity and irregularity, the work of Friedman illustrates how the domains of cultural globalization are subject to social practices of identification. In the following sections, I will (1) discuss the anthropological approaches of the aforementioned authors in a literature review and (2) demonstrate how YBI epitomizes cultural processes often visible in the global movement of consumer products. The analysis is based on information generated through an in-person interview with Sister Yeshiyah.

Theoretical approach:

In recent decades, the "global cultural economy" has gradually shifted from a capitalist hierarchy of center-periphery interactions to a more complex system that involves a disjuncture of transnational movements and flows. While much of what occurs through transnational flows involves economic processes, the nature of globalization today encompasses an even stronger feature of cultural exchange. More specifically, what several scholars understand about the world today is that the global arena possesses a fluid and disorganized nature that is associated with culture, place, and identity. Such is the case in Appadurai's (2001) anthropological approach as he divides the world into ethnoscaples (the movement of people across cultures and borders), financescaples (the flow of capital), mediascaples (the movement of electronic capabilities, media, and information), technoscaples (the spread of technology and software goods), and ideoscaples (the movement of political ideas and representations) (Appadurai 2001: 589-590). Within

this theoretical framework, Appadurai holds that each *scape* is manifested in the realm of “imagined worlds” because disjunctures in the world system contribute to the different realities and perspectives that constitute it. To communicate his main idea, Appadurai explains that the result of these global cultural flows is a complex and dynamic interplay between homogenization and heterogenization – one that connects local societies with the global *scapes*.

Appadurai similarly articulates the existence of cultural mobility through global flows and how cravings for new commodities through locality “become a fetish that disguises the globally dispersed forces that actually drive the production process” (Appadurai 2001: 596). His theory acknowledges that production in the global economy may work to mislead communities by creating, in turn, disjointed and “imagined” identities. Moreover, he specifically makes reference to clothing styles as instruments of homogenization that are ultimately “absorbed into local political and cultural economies” in the process of globalization (Appadurai 2001: 596). In this sense, Appadurai is telling readers that “commodities and designs of difference” that were once global become increasingly local in the regions to which they are exposed. At the same time, he states how the “central feature of global culture today” is based on the struggle between “sameness and difference to cannibalize each other” as well as between homogenizing states and ethnic movements (Appadurai 2001: 596). Appadurai reveals how homogenization (through globalizing processes) and heterogenization (through localizing processes) occur simultaneously in the overlapping global *scapes*.

In Jonathan Friedman’s “global systems approach”, “a whole series of local and localizing phenomena, ethnicity, nationalism, and indigenous movements can be understood as global products... [and] localizing strategies are themselves inherently global” (Friedman 1995: 5). Like Appadurai, Friedman also claims that the process of globalization often roots from cultural movements. However, he argues that “the global arena is a product of a definite set of dynamic properties including the formation of center/periphery structures, their expansion, contraction, fragmentation, and re-establishment throughout cycles of shifting hegemony” (Friedman 1995: 11). Each of these properties makes up the global system and thus gives a more convoluted understanding of cultural globalization processes.

For Friedman, the common meaning of globalization is seen in “the flow of meaningful objects and ideas that retain their meaning in the movements” (Friedman 1995: 24). More importantly, the concept of “homogenization” ultimately entails that “the frames of attribution of meaning to belong to the same frame as the place where the ‘thing’ was first produced” (Friedman 1995: 15). For Friedman, cultural globalization must assign a “stable frame of global reference that allows access from different parts of the global system to the same set of expressions or representations” (Friedman 1995: 15). However, he also affirms that, with globalization, “conditions of identification of both self and other have changed” and thus altered the meaning behind those objects and ideas because product differentiation allows for modification to local tastes. In this process, which Friedman calls

“weak globalization”, the local is able to assimilate the global into its practiced meaning (Friedman 1995: 29).

One of the most significant contributions that Friedman includes in his article is the theoretical notion of “disillusioned cosmopolitanism” (Friedman 1995: 17-18). Friedman argues that the cosmopolitan actor (in the form of persons, businesses, or institutions) “can only play roles and participate superficially in other people’s realities, but can have no reality of his own other than alterity itself” (Friedman 1995: 18). In other words, meanings attributed to certain objects can easily become distorted as the cosmopolitan aims at self-identifying with them in a setting away from their origin. This “practice of cosmopolitanism is predicated on maintaining distance [and] often superiority to the local” while also participating in many worlds without truly becoming a part of them. Unauthentic cosmopolitan actors are ultimately able to survive in their old identities by redefining the objects they enjoy (Friedman 1995: 18).

Analysis of case

Both Appadurai and Friedman’s anthropological theories provide the lens into which we see YBI African Fashion and Apparel as a prime example of a local business that is experiencing cultural globalization. These approaches raise many questions for this particular case study. First, how are global cultural movements manifested in this small local business? Second, to what extent do ethnoscaples and financescapes intersect to create a more complex process of globalization for YBI? Third, how does the local consumption of clothing and accessories from the African diaspora affect the cultural meanings of the objects that are tied to it? And fourth, how does this “translation” of products of African culture through YBI affect the identities of those Americans who end up buying and sporting the apparel throughout Baltimore? These questions are significant because they not only assess how global dimensions impact this local business, but also take it a step further to observe how globalization’s fluidity can also influence the culture and identity of the actors involved. The paragraphs below shed light on these different aspects of the local business.

After traveling to Ghana in West Africa, Sister Yeshiyah B. Israel was inspired to begin her own line of traditional African fashion here in Baltimore in order to “awaken the Africa in America” and to ultimately “bring modesty back”. Sister Yeshiyah can trace her roots back to Sub-Saharan Africa and continually claims that African culture is in her DNA so she “loves and wears it proudly”. She also asserts that over the past few years she has learned “how to be more global with fashion because [Americans] are learning more and more about wearing African culture”. Sister Yeshiyah has noticed that many people are gaining interest in commodities that reinforce African tradition, especially in the United States. This exemplifies Appadurai’s notion of commodity fetishism, as people tend to crave unique global products. Through YBI, African culture is turned into a commodity. In addition to retailing its various products, the company ultimately

aims at making a difference. On its website, YBI pledges that part of each purchase goes towards meals and schooling for poor, orphaned children in several East African countries. Thus, YBI is at the intersection of an ethnoscape, or the African diaspora, represented by the business owner, and a financescape in form of the business transactions which link the consumer in Baltimore to producers in Ghana as well as the children there who receive part of the proceedings.

As someone who grew up in a household of seamstresses, Sister Yeshiyah is dedicated to not only producing her own exclusive clothing items, but also marketing other apparel, designs, and fabrics from vendors in New York, California, the District of Columbia, and even Accra, Ghana. Over the past few years, she has taken part in multiple fashion shows and conventions as an opportunity to promote her clothing and to get an idea of what new styles are “in” that she can incorporate in her ethnic fashion. She advocates for selling numerous customized pieces of clothing, artifacts, and beauty products as well as a children’s line which aims at diversifying the range of customers. Much of the apparel is tailored for different body frames of customers who make special requests. Overall, Sister Yeshiyah markets clothing that harnesses an urban style while still maintaining its ethnic foundation. This act of “glocalizing” the clothing and accessories to accommodate for the local tastes of people within the United States links with the idea of “cultural appropriation” and raise the question of how it is possible that distinct cultural meanings behind these articles of clothing be somewhat lost in translation. As Friedman predicts, cosmopolitan businesses such as YBI often work to alter the deeper meaning behind the very articles of clothing it sells as it attempts to tailor its products to local tastes of consumers in Baltimore. Instead of keeping the designs of these traditional ethnic clothes as they originally were, YBI is redefining the clothing in an act suggestive of disillusioned cosmopolitanism.

The goal of the business stems from a growing desire to get in touch with the ethnic identity that is manifested in African culture; specifically through apparel. In many ways, YBI has adopted a form of cultural expression rooted from the African diaspora. Many people take pride and joy in emulating that very tribal and ethnic fashion that depicts much of the African apparel we see today. Many of Sister Yeshiyah’s customers come to her store because “they want to get in touch with their roots” and/or identify with the African culture through physical appearance. On one hand, YBI may simply serve to promote and show appreciation for African culture through heritage and way of life. On the other hand, this business symbolizes a common form of appropriating the identification and meaning behind the products that are sold in other parts of the world. YBI generates sales by clinging on to this notion of revitalizing African in America, which can contribute to a hybridization of both cultures.

Conclusion and lessons

While the latest styles of fashion continue to change with time, there are many designs and clothing elements that remain constant to the specific culture they aim to epitomize. Economic flows that involve local “globalized” businesses are not only subject to an economic logic; they are also cultural processes that generate sameness and difference. The anthropological perspectives of Appadurai (2001) and Friedman (1995) particularly focus on the cultural dimensions of globalization as they pertain to identity within different landscapes of our world. YBI African Apparel and Fashion not only allows us to delve into this cultural notion of global flows, but also gives us a look into how complex and fluid this process can be for the identities of the people involved. With this knowledge, it is important that consumers everywhere better understand the products that they buy and that all local producers market their products in their purest and truest sense possible.

Sister Yeshiyah’s next steps and goals are geared towards not only expanding her business on a national scale but also connecting it with more organizations that will allow her to make greater positive impacts in poor African countries. One way in which businesses such as YBI can widen the scope of their impact is by promoting expertise and strategies on how to successfully maintain a market for local African producers who may lack access to resources. In addition, it is important that businesses that sell products adopted from foreign cultures and countries devote more time to understand the meaning behind those products and to establish practices that increase the consumers’ awareness of that meaning.

References

- Appadurai, A. 2001. “Disjuncture and Difference in the Global Cultural Economy,” in *Media and Cultural Studies: Key Works*, edited by M. Durham and D. Kellner, Blackwell: Oxford.
- Durham, M and Kellner, D. 2001. “Adventures in Media and Cultural Studies: Introducing the KeyWorks,” in *Media and Cultural Studies: Key Works*, edited by M. Durham and D. Kellner, Blackwell: Oxford.
- Hooks, B. 2001 “Eating the Other, Desire and Resistance” in *Media and Cultural Studies: Key Works*, edited by M. Durham and D. Kellner, Blackwell: Oxford.
- Friedman, J. 1995. “Global System, Globalization and the Parameters of Modernity: Is Modernity a Cultural System?,” in *Global Modernities*, edited by M. Featherstone, S. Lash and R. Robertson, London: SAGE.
- Marx, K. and Engels, F. 1848. *Manifesto of the Communist Party* (pp. 14-22)



7

Guns, Butter, and Customs Regulations: A Case Study of Airschott, Inc.

Hannah Schott

Introduction

Airschott, Inc. is a customs broker and freight forwarder with locations near Dulles Airport, in Virginia, Baltimore-Washington International Airport, in Baltimore County, and Hartsfield-Jackson International Airport, near Atlanta. In its industry, it is a relatively small business, but with a multitude of transnational ties. The way the company manages to compete with multinational corporations that also operate in this industry is by establishing bilateral ties with overseas agents in the locations relevant to the economic interests of its clients and proximal to the locations that they serve. In this study, I explore the ways in which this company is impacted by national and international laws and how these regulations posit Airschott against its multinational competitors. To analyze the issue, I will be using the economic perspective on globalization offered by Joseph E. Stiglitz in his book “Globalization and its Discontents”. Stiglitz’s approach is one that heavily criticizes current trends in economic globalization. I collected information through an interview with Robert Schott, the founder and CEO of this firm, and with Joanne Perlman, its secretary treasurer, who is also in charge of quality control, personnel, and software.

Theoretical approach:

Joseph E. Stiglitz defines globalization as “...the closer integration of the countries and peoples of the world which has been brought about by the enormous reduction of costs in transportation and communication, and the breaking down of artificial barriers to the flows of goods, services, capital, knowledge, and (to a lesser extent) people across borders” (Stiglitz: 9). While Stiglitz is a major supporter of the benefits of globalization as a whole, which have contributed positively to human welfare and safety, he criticizes international economic organizations, such as the World Trade Organization, the World Bank, and the International Monetary Fund, for their hypocrisy, inequity, and pressures and conditions placed on the actions of developing countries. The IMF, according to Stiglitz, was supposed to focus on macroeconomic stability, but has ended up taking a somewhat imperialist stance. He claims that, in spite of the fact that this organization was supposed to help nations that were struggling economically, it ended up doing more harm than good and typically supported the interests of states and capitalist actors based in core countries. Stiglitz’s perspective is that globalization is inherently neither good nor bad, but that it has the potential for tremendous amounts of either. He characterizes the current state of globalization as one of “global governance without global government” (Stiglitz: 21). Stiglitz also claims that social cohesion is an important factor that helps

economies function. He argues that both governments and markets have shortcomings and, therefore, must work together. Because of this observation, he concludes that current trends in economic globalization are problematic because of the prevalence of “market fundamentalism” (Stiglitz: 221).

Stiglitz’s theoretical proposal is that there needs to be global public institutions that help create regulations for economic globalization oriented to the public interest. In spite of his thorough criticism of the IMF, Stiglitz states that there is a need for global systems of governance. He says that globalization has “enhanced the need for global collective action and the importance of global public goods” (Stiglitz: 224) and one of the most critical points he makes is that “The most fundamental change that is required to make globalization work in the way that it should is a change in governance” (Stiglitz: 226). According to this perspective, greater voice should be given to people in countries with less economic power and one of the most important ways to ensure this is to increase transparency in the works of organizations of global governance. In his aforementioned book, he presents a list of suggested reforms to address these issues (Stiglitz: 236-240):

1. Capital market liberalization needs to be recognized as dangerous.
2. Reformation of bankruptcy.
3. Greater regulation of banks and fewer bailouts.
4. Greater levels of risk management.
5. Better safety nets.
6. Better responses to economic crises.
7. A reduction of reliance on investing and a greater emphasis on basic economic practices.

Analysis of case

Stiglitz’s theoretical approach is relevant to Airschott’s practices because it is concerned with the regulation of economic globalization at primarily the international level, but also at the national level. It is also a theory that considers whose interests are being served by global governance and how that impacts the equity and ethics of economic globalization. A corporation such as Airschott is impacted by international and national regulations and it is important to pay attention to whose interests come into play in the formation of these regulations and how the competition between small and large customs brokerage and freight forwarding businesses is impacted by them. Airschott works with international imports and exports by both air and sea and helps move its clients through the bureaucratic customs regulations processes. It deals with national tariffs, international trade, and global economic structures. The goal of my analysis is to learn about the ways in which Airschott is constrained or enabled by national and international economic regulations, to show how the corporation operates in an uneven playing field of economic globalization (how it creates a market for itself that allows it to compete with other, larger companies), and to learn whether regulations favor the interests of large companies more

than that of smaller ones like Airschott. Below are my interviews with Robert Schott and Joanne Perlman, the CEO and Secretary Treasurer of Airschott, Inc., in which I explore those issues.

How would you describe what your business does?

Robert replied immediately and simply: “We move stuff”, to which Joanne added, “...around the world, particularly in and out of the United States.”. When I asked them to explain more Robert went on to explain that they are customs brokers and freight forwarders, which means that they help traders move stuff across borders.

How do you market yourself to gain an edge against multinational competitors?

Robert and Joanne explained that they have a niche market and that because they are a small business they are able to walk their customers through the process of transporting their goods. They are specifically focused on sensitive cargo and goods that multinationals might have a harder time with. Robert said that typically multinationals are focused on getting high volumes of freight shipped, so they might not have time to deal with importers and exporters who have to go through more extensive regulatory processes. They said that Airschott’s main focus is “guns and butter”, which is an expression that appropriately describes the more general fact that they deal mostly with shipments of weapons, food, and alcohol.

What are some of the regulations given by both the United States and the national governments of your clients and how do these either constrain or facilitate your productivity and success?

Joanne answered this question by explaining that the regulations are what make it extremely difficult for people to move freight around the world and that national and international regulations are in fact what make the existence of companies like Airschott possible. I reframed Joanne’s response by asking her if one could say that constraints on globalization are what create a market for their business, which she affirmed but Robert disagreed with. He said that it was not quite true that constraints on globalization created a market for them and explained that the proliferation of economic globalization serves to enhance the value of Airschott’s services. In order to reconcile or make sense of their divergent responses, we could say that increases in globalization mean more business since there is a larger volume of international trade, but on the other hand, constraints on globalization make international trade operations complicated, which also creates more business for the company. Basically, both the expansion of and limits on globalization contribute in different ways to creating business for Airschott. Some of the specific regulations that Joanne addressed and described were customs regulations and tariffs.

These customs regulations come in a massive book that can now be accessed online. Robert added that U.S. law also comes into play and so do the laws and customs regulations of other nations. The vast extent of the laws and regulations they have to deal with regularly prompted me to ask how much one needs to know about them to be in their industry. The answer was that one has to know how to look up the information and understand the jargon. Robert described a number of specific chapters of customs regulations he has memorized that impact their industry. In order to deal with the laws and regulations of other nations, they form relationships with agents around the world who are in the same line of business as them. Those agents give Airschott the information they need and handle the processes that go on from their end. Multinational customs brokers and freight forwarders have their own locations in different parts of the world, so they have no need to develop these kinds of relationships.

What are some of the international regulations that constrain or facilitate your productivity and success?

The first organization mentioned was unsurprisingly the World Trade Organization, followed by United Nations treaties. One relevant treaty that they mentioned was CITES, the Convention on International Trade of Endangered Species, which prevents the trade of endangered species across borders. There are also regional trade agreements such as NAFTA, the North American Free Trade Agreement, that make the transportation of goods more challenging due to the creation of more rules that result from these agreements. Both Robert and Joanne said that these kinds of treaties and international regulations do impact their business, but not in a positive or negative way. Basically, customs brokers and freight forwarders need a huge knowledge base and need to know how to look up information.

What regulations work most in your favor and which would you like to change?

The organization that creates the greatest regulatory difficulties and impediments according to Joanne is the TSA (Transportation Security Agency). The DoT (U.S. Department of Transportation) is also a source of frustration to the business because of the inconvenience of their mandatory drug tests for truck drivers. Overall, they struggled to answer the question of which organizations work most in their favor. As they said earlier, customs regulations make importing and exporting goods more difficult, which creates the market need for customs brokers and freight forwarders such as Airschott who have the knowledge base necessary to navigate customs processes.

Joanne soon remembered one of the main helpful regulations that she had initially forgotten to mention. She said that the best thing to ever happen to their industry was the United States' adoption of the Harmonized Tariff Schedule for classifying merchandise in the late 1980's. She said that she believes it was the World Trade Organization that came up with the Harmonized Tariff, which is another huge book. It is a system for which the first six

digits are used to classify commodities internationally and for which the last four digits are country specific. The Harmonized Tariff could be characterized as a powerful globalizing instrument in the customs brokerage and freight forwarding industry. The system used prior to the current one was TSUS, the Tariff Schedule of the United States, but the current Harmonized Tariff Schedule is international. Robert corrected Joanne's statement that the World Trade Organization that came up with this system and explained that it was actually the Customs Co-operation Council in Brussels. This system uses numerical codes specific to different nations, so people in the customs brokerage and freight forwarding industries can look up the statistics of other countries to identify what their imports and exports are and how much they are importing and exporting.

At this point we started to diverge from the initial question, but Joanne and Robert shared a great deal of other important information. Another development that Joanne identified as being of great significance to their industry was not a regulation, but rather an invention. She talked about the importance of the shipping container. In the past people would load boxes and crates onto a truck directly. Since this invention, whole containers get placed onto vessels in order to ensure more efficient transportation. Shipping containers made transporting goods cheaper, safer, and easier. Robert cited this invention as a clear benefit to globalization. There is machinery designed to pull containers off of ships, put them on chassis for either trucks or trains, and send them off to their destinations where they get unloaded. Any shipping companies can use any containers. ISO, the international Standards Organization, develops standards for shipping containers. Each of them are eight by eight by twenty feet on the outside. Joanne said that this invention and the international standards surrounded it have revolutionized globalization.

I mentioned that it seemed as though economic globalization fuels the existence of Airschott, and Joanne concurred and said of course, "Without global trade we wouldn't exist at all." Robert shared some of the history of customs brokerage and freight forwarding organizations. He said that the industry stems from the days of sailing ships and explained that they still use a lot of marine terminology from that initial era. They even utilize old marine terminology when dealing with air freight. I then pointed out that it seems as though their industry deals primarily with global flows of technology and money. Joanne agreed and added that it is mostly concerned with restrictions on the technology someone can export. Robert added that giving information to a foreign national is often tantamount to exporting that information, which could be a violation. The example he gave regarded one of his clients who gives people defense training based on goods such as weapons that have been shipped to their country. In order to give people defense training they need to have an export license because that training involves exported goods that come under specific customs regulations.

Is there any industry association that represents these companies and interacts with governments?

There are organizations that businesses in this industry can join, such as WACO, the World Air Cargo Organization. WACO creates a network of organizations and agents and helps businesses such as Airschott compete with multinationals. The primary organization my interviewees referred to was the NCBFAA, or the National Customs Brokers and Forwarders Association of America, which holds an annual conference that takes place in various parts of the country. The NCBFAA also has a PAC (Political Action Committee) that lobbies the government. There is also an International Association of Customs Brokers.

I once again brought up larger, transnational regulating forces and we went into further discussion about the World Trade Organization. My interviewees also talked about other such forces such as organizations that regulate HAZMATs, which are hazardous material and items. Robert then mentioned the IMDG, International Maritime Dangerous Goods Code, which was developed by the IMO (International Maritime Organization). This is one of the specific regulations designed to deal with the transportation of hazardous materials. These kinds of regulations are extremely important to Airschott's functioning and its ability to help its clients and they are also very much critical to safety. We discussed and agreed about the great importance of regulating the transnational organizations that deal with important international concerns such as safety.

Conclusion

The information obtained in the interviews helped answer my questions about Airschott's relationship with economic globalization and its regulation on the national and international level. What I found contradicted my initial assumption that the company would be hindered by national and international regulatory systems. I was surprised to learn that complicated regulations on both a national and international scale are essential to the company's existence because clients would otherwise not seek the services that Airschott provides. The proliferation of economic globalization is what allows the customs brokerage and freight forwarding industry to exist, but neoliberal policies and total international market deregulation would both work against Airschott's business and would make international trade far more dangerous. In reference to Stiglitz's model, we can also see how important it is for the transnational agencies and customs to be carefully regulated.

There are some major points that came out of the discussion that I would particularly like to draw upon. First, the firm's representatives brought up CITES, the agreement formed by the World Trade Organization to prevent the international shipment of endangered species. This kind of regulation is important for the preservation of biodiversity and the protection of wildlife. The second is the international Harmonized

Tariff Schedule, which is an important part of international cooperation, organization, and efficient communication. The invention of the shipping container was also a huge development in economic globalization and the international codes surrounding shipping containers help ensure greater levels of safety and efficiency. The final point that I want to mention as a significant part of the theoretical framework I am using is the International Maritime Dangerous Goods Code, which is another regulation that helps ensure the safety of parties on both ends of the shipment process. All of these points are tied to regulations on international trade that serve functional purposes that are related to efficiency, safety, protection of animals, the wellbeing of humans, or any combination of the above. This is a scenario in which strict regulations governing global economic processes benefit private corporations, generate and support the existence of certain profitable industries, and serve greater public safety issues. My discussion with the leaders of Airschott illustrated Stiglitz's claim that global governance is needed to promote economic globalization in a stable way. I would even hypothesize that it is in part the corporate benefits generated by these regulations that encourage regulatory organizations to create these often socially beneficial regulations that impede free international transactions. I would now like to know how transnational organizations that regulate economic globalization such as the WTO, IMF, and World Bank can start developing more equitable policies to support the needs and efficacy of the disempowered they try to serve as well as those of the more powerful private interests.

References

Stiglitz, Joseph E. *Globalization and Its Discontents*. New York: WW. Norton, 2002.

"Welcome to Airschott Homepage." Airschott. Accessed March 24, 2015.

"Welcome to Seaschott Homepage." Seaschott. Accessed March 24, 2015.

Robert Schott and Joanne Perlman, CEO and Secretary Treasurer of Airschott, Inc., Derwood, Maryland, interviews on March 28, 2015.



8

Global Principles, Local Practices: Montessori Education in Baltimore

Elizabeth Rudt

Introduction

Montessori education was created in the early 20th century in Italy and since then it has spread to classrooms in almost every country in the world. The Baltimore Montessori Public Charter School (BMPCS) was founded in 2008 as part of the Baltimore City Public School System (BCPSS). Today, it is one of at least 1,150 Montessori schools in the United States (Baltimore Montessori Public Charter School 2015). Whenever a set of cultural elements — such as a body of educational principles — spreads across the world, the receiving end will tend to indigenize the practice in its own ways (Appadurai 2001). This paper will explore this issue in the context of the BMPCS. The goal is to understand how the school translates global principles of Montessori education to practice in its the local, Baltimore, community, which has its own culture and established educational practices.

Arjun Appadurai's theory of cultural globalization provides the framework of analysis for this case study. Data and information will be drawn from the BMPCS website, interviews with the BMPCS, local news and scholarly journal articles on the topics of American values, Baltimore public schools and the Montessori method. Montessori education has largely been adapted in the United States to allow an easy transition for students into traditional American methods of education in the later school years. Evidence suggests that Montessori principles give students proper tools to navigate and succeed within the Baltimore Public School System, showing the benefits of a local adaptation of a global cultural flow.

Theoretical approach: Appadurai's cultural theory of globalization

Contemporary socio-cultural anthropologist Arjun Appadurai claims that theories of globalization from the past focus on Marxist concepts to a fault and are not holistic. Appadurai offers his own theory, which is admittedly general, claiming that global cultural flows lead to homogeneity and heterogeneity of culture at the same time. Appadurai claims that “the imagination has become an organized field of social practices, a form of work... and a form of negotiation between sites of agency (individuals) and globally defined fields of possibility” (Appadurai 2001: 587). In this way, shared global ideas are interpreted subjectively.

Homogenization, often discussed for its potential negative impacts through processes such as the Americanization of the world, is not necessarily a bad thing because it is often matched by forces of cultural heterogenization (Appadurai 2001). Whenever ideas or practices are brought into new cultures they tend to be indigenized in some way,

preserving elements of that culture. For example, the McDonald's franchise has many store locations in Kuwait and the United Arab Emirates, where they offer typical McDonald's meals, but also a "McArabia Chicken" which is a culturally adapted version of the McChicken (A La Carte 2015). Homogenization has occurred through the presence of McDonalds there, but culinary cultural differences are honored. In addition, Appadurai claims that national states tend to regulate how much difference is allowed within countries, promoting national cultural homogeneity in opposition to global homogenization and cultural minorities within the national territory. It is also important to note that homogenization is not the same as globalization; it is a process of globalization and does not encompass all that globalization is (Appadurai 2001).

Processes of globalization that lead to homogenization or heterogenization are organized in Appadurai's conceptual framework of global scapes, the imagined landscapes of globalization (Appadurai 2001). There are five different scapes through which globalization occurs: technoscape, mediascape, ideoscape, financescape and ethnoscape (Appadurai 2001). The technoscape refers to the global configurations of technology and the speed at which it permeates boundaries. Mediascape and ideoscape both refer to "the distribution of the electronic capabilities to produce and disseminate information... and to the images of the world created by these media," (Appadurai 2001: 590). The ideoscape deals more specifically with the ideological tendencies of states and the counterideologies offered by social movements geared towards obtaining power. The financescape refers to the important, but difficult to follow, flows of capital across state boundaries or global economic interactions. The ethnoscape more simply refers to the movement of people into and across new and different cultural landscapes. Scapes can take different forms according to differing individual perspectives, especially among displaced populations that are balancing between different cultures.

Appadurai specifically argues that global flows "occur in and through the growing disjunctures" between these scapes (Appadurai 2001: 592). Disjuncture refers to the ways in which scapes depart from one another, while conjuncture refers to ways in which they agree. Disjuncture often leads to greater action and change than conjuncture as it can ignite a "battle of the imagination" between nation and state or between states (Appadurai 2001: 594). Appadurai argues people should "begin to think of the configuration of cultural forms in today's world as fundamentally fractal, that is, as possessing no Euclidean boundaries, structures, or regularities," (Appadurai 2001: 599). It is also important to know that these irregular cultural forms overlap in many ways. Although Appadurai's theory is general, it seeks to make people aware of the large and complex scope of globalization where other theories may not. Additionally, it leads people to expect not stability, but chaos when observing global cultural flows.

Origins of Montessori education and its incursion into the United States

Montessori education was developed by Dr. Maria Montessori, the first woman to earn an M.D. degree at the University of Rome in Italy (Association Montessori Internationale 2015). Dr. Montessori stumbled upon her education style when she opened a school for children called Casa dei Bambini or children's house on January 6, 1907 (Association Montessori Internationale 2015). Dr. Montessori found that surrounding the students with a stimulating environment gave them the tools to educate themselves. In this way, the method is child-focused and allows students to move through their environment at their own pace when learning. Activity is an important element of learning and students are encouraged to move around. By contrast, traditional methods of teaching are rooted in practices of the church. The concept of lecture in classrooms today is the product of sermon, and the classroom environment of rows facing the teacher was modeled after the church environment. This form of disseminating information was not designed to educate children specifically, but the masses, most often adults (Guisepi). Many of the first schools were private, religious institutions with ideologies rooted in exclusivity and racism as education was only provided for the rich and white (Guisepi). During the 18th century as more scientific discoveries were being made, people began to seek more practical schools for their children (Guisepi). Benjamin Franklin opened the first of what would be many secondary schools offering a practical alternative to the Latin model in 1751 (Guisepi). During the 19th and early 20th century, discoveries of better ways to educate children were made across Europe and were largely successful in attracting international attention (Guisepi). Montessori education was one of them.

The United States began to fund public schooling and to try some of these new European methods during the early 19th century. The educational system began to move backwards, however, as the rate of urbanization increased drastically during the industrial revolution. There was a population boom and the increased number of pupils pushed schools to revert back to church-like classrooms as this was a faster way to teach (Guisepi). Though faster, it was not necessarily better for children to learn in this way. Today, this is still the traditional model of education in the United States. Systems across the country teach streamlined material to children who are then loosely tested on this material through standardized tests to verify whether the system is working in this very narrow way.

Montessori education in an American setting has been researched by teachers, educational journals, historians, and political thinkers for its curiously quick adaptation to the American system. "Approximately 50 districts (255 schools) in the U.S. have public Montessori programs," today (Baltimore Montessori Public Charter School 2015). As Montessori education becomes more present within American school systems, small scale cultural hybridization occurs as foreign educational principles are altered slightly to fit the needs and requirements of traditional American schools and culture. In 1960, the American

Montessori Society (AMS) was created by Dr. Nancy McCormick Rambusch, the United States representative of the Association Montessori International (AMI) (Montessori Education 2015). During the mid-20th century the AMS began providing a guide (teacher) certification program slightly different from that of the AMI in order to “forge inroads to mainstream education,” in the United States (Montessori Education 2015). Leadership of the AMI did not like these changes to the AMS and in 1963 the two disassociated but still support one another today (Montessori Education 2015). In many American Montessori schools, a mix of AMI and AMS can be seen as guides (teachers) can obtain certification from the program they like best.

Disjunctures between the ideoscapes of the traditional United States school system and the ideoscapes of its democratic political system have led to heightened interest in Montessori education as an alternative model potentially more effective in preparing individuals for democratic civil life. Williams and Keith have found that an important component of democracy is inclusivity, which is not taught effectively in traditional school systems of the United States. “Traditional education fosters self-centered competition for personal, rather than group, enhancement,” while “Montessori students learn to become interdependent and resourceful,” (Williams & Keith 2000). Additionally, “traditional students learn to be controllable,” a practice more aligned with authoritarian ideoscapes, (Williams & Keith 2000). Montessori education is praised for incorporating American ideoscapes of freedom and democracy into its practice while democracy was born in Athens, Greece along the Mediterranean, and was carried into the American political system through numerous processes of globalization (Williams & Keith 2000). Montessori education fosters this ideoscape of democracy through empowerment of students to be aware of themselves in the context of the whole and emphasis on cooperation (Williams & Keith 2000).

Another aspect of the American ideoscape is individual freedom (Appadurai 2001). Research shows that Dr. Montessori contributed to studies of freedom in developing her model to include freedom of method and freedom of achievement (John 1927). Freedom of method refers to a child’s ability to move autonomously through the environment prepared for them by the guide (John 1927). Freedom of achievement refers to the child’s own liberty to achieve control over their own abilities and space (John 1927). Traditional education is more an imposition of knowledge onto the child rather than an open flow between adult and child (John 1927). This type of interaction fosters respect and creates a bond of trust between teacher and student that emphasizes individual freedom (John 1927).

In traditional public schools in the United States, “work is associated not with ‘desire’ but with ‘productivity’ and ‘employments,’” (Cossentino 2006: 66). Montessori education differs from traditional U.S interests as work in the Montessori model is led by desire and not productivity. The United States ideoscape and mediascape projections of money are indicative of capitalism in the financescape of U.S society. Capitalism, from a Marxist perspective, reduces people to modes of production, functioning as a cog in the system. Many facets of the American mediascape equate money to the ability to fulfill

desires, and work is simply a means to obtain money. In some ways this is misaligned with the American dream, in which a person is free to conquer the world around them and be successful doing what they love. Montessori education encourages students to work on things that they internalize as fun. Learning is done mostly through play and engagement with the environment, there are few strict expectations, and rarely is everyone taught the same thing as if the students themselves are on a factory assembly line (Cossentino 2006). In a way, Montessori education aligns with American ideals, and not necessarily American practices as there is a disjuncture between the American dream (ideoscape), representation of work in popular culture (mediascape) and the way people actually experience their work environment (financescape).

Montessori education in Baltimore

Founder of the BMPCS, Allison Shecter, finds “that families are looking for different things and want choices,” indicating that many families in Baltimore City are already looking for alternatives. Educational alternatives have been more and more common in Baltimore City as the charter school system was designed to encourage this type of growth and diversification. Today, the BMPCS caters to students from 24 different zip codes. In their 2012 application to renew their charter they claim to “have thrived in the challenge of bringing Montessori education to a diverse urban population” (BMPCS Application to Renew Charter 2012: 2).

As a public school, the Montessori school is required to implement certain standardized tests which give them data that they can then compare to the rest of the district. One of these tests is the MSA on which BMPCS students in 2012 scored an 83.2% proficiency on reading and a 62.1% proficiency in math (BMPCS Application to Renew Charter 2012). This reading score exceeds the district average by 16.2%, a phenomenal accomplishment, while math scores were lower than the district by the small margin of 1% (BMPCS Application to Renew Charter 2012). “Third grade students, the first testing cohort that predominantly came through the BMPCS program, did exceed the district average (77.5% to 73.6% in math, and 87.1% to 65.5% in reading),” (BMPCS Application to Renew Charter 2012). The attendance rate for students with disabilities, 94.5%, is higher than the district’s rate of 92.4%, and their chronic absence rate of 9.4% is lower than the district’s rate of 14.2% for students K - 5, (BMPCS Application to Renew Charter 2012). According to data and surveys, parent satisfaction ranges from 85-95% and, “As indicated through focus groups during the SER and [their] climate survey, [BMPCS] students, staff and families feel that Baltimore Montessori is a safe and supportive learning environment,” (BMPCS Application to Renew Charter 2012: 15). The BMPCS is also moving towards implementing common core curriculum of Baltimore City while maintaining its Montessori methods and identity (Charter Renewal Application 2012).

The Montessori school has not fit into the school system so easily that there are no problems. During the 2011 school year “several teachers were on Performance Improvement

Plans; one did not have her contract renewed; three (all of whom struggled with working in a public school setting) resigned,” (BMPCS Application to Renew Charter 2012: 21). The challenges of finding Montessori guides “who are comfortable in an urban setting and willing to meet the accountability demands of working with diverse populations in a public school,” are affecting the BMPCS as Montessori is difficult to fit into the public school model. In 2012 the BMPCS had their charter renewed for only three more years opposed to five, one of the reasons being: “poor, black students lag significantly behind white students” (Green 2013). This shows that though their performance is higher than the overall district in many ways, the school may not be catering to the predominant racial group of Baltimore, the Black community.

Conclusions and lessons

The problems faced by the BMPCS are small in comparison with all of its successes and promises. Baltimore City houses more charter schools than any other district in Maryland. These schools are allowed more freedom to tailor educational methods to different students’ needs (Thornton’s holding pattern for Baltimore schools 2015). Charter schools, like the Montessori school, focus on testing out alternative methods for the youth of the city that might better serve their needs. In the future of education, more deviation from the traditional model should be allowed everywhere as the Montessori method has shown good results in Baltimore.

References

- A La Carte. 2015. McDonalds. Retrieved May 15, 2015, from http://www.mcdonaldsarabia.com/kuwait/en/our_food/Menu/a_la_carte.html
- Appadurai, A. 2001. “Disjuncture and Difference in the Global Cultural Economy,” in *Media and Cultural Studies: Key Works*, edited by M. Durham and D. Kellner, Blackwell: Oxford.
- Association Montessori Internationale. 2015. Association Montessori Internationale. Retrieved May 15, 2015, from <http://ami-global.org/>
- Baltimore Montessori Public Charter School. (2015). Retrieved May 15, 2015, from <http://www.baltimorecityschools.org/336>
- BMPCS Application to Renew Charter. (2012, September 21). Retrieved May 16, 2015, from http://www.baltimorecityschools.org/cms/lib/MD01001351/Centricity/Domain/7912/BMPCS_Renewal_App9.18.12_PDF.pdf
- COSENTINO, JACQUELINE M. (2006) *Big Work: Goodness, Vocation, and Engagement in the Montessori Method*. Curriculum Inquiry 361. Blackwell Publishing Inc. Retrieved online at: <http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1467-873X.2006.00346.x/epdf>
- Green, E. (2013, January 10). City recommends severing ties with operators of six schools. Retrieved May 16, 2015, from http://articles.baltimoresun.com/2013-01-10/news/bs-md-ci-charter-school-recommendations-20130110_1_baltimore-charter-schools-transformation-school-innovation-schools

- Guisepi, R. (n.d.). The History of Education. Retrieved May 15, 2015, from http://history-world.org/history_of_education.htm
- John, A. S. 1927. "MONTESSORI AND SOCIAL PROGRESS." *Sociological Review* (1908-1952), 19(3): 197-207. Retrieved online at: <http://web.a.ebscohost.com/ehost/pdfviewer/pdfviewer?sid=fd63589c-115f-49ba-adc1-e152907a2116%40sessionmgr4002&vid=1&hid=4101>
- Montessori Education. 2015. American Montessori Society. Retrieved May 15, 2015, from <http://amshq.org/Montessori-Education>
- Stringfield, S. C., & Yakimowski-Srebnick, M. E. 2005." Promise, progress, problems, and paradoxes of three phases of accountability: A longitudinal case study of the Baltimore City public schools." *American Educational Research Journal*. 42(1): 43-75.
- "Thornton's holding pattern for Baltimore schools." May 7, 2015. Retrieved May 16, 2015, from <http://www.baltimoresun.com/news/opinion/editorial/bs-ed-schools-budget-20150507-story.html>
- Williams, N., & Keith, R. 2000. "Democracy and Montessori Education." *Peace Review*. 12(2): 217-222. Retrieved online at: <http://web.a.ebscohost.com/ehost/detail/detail?sid=56ac2b91-829f-4819-a000-f8acc1051f19%40sessionmgr4003&vid=0&hid=4101&bdata=JnNpdGU9ZWhvc3QtG12ZSZzY29wZT1zaXRl#db=sih&AN=3361960>.



9

Planting Seeds of Change and Growing Resistance: a Case Study of Baltimore's 32nd Street Farmers' Market

Melina Latona

Introduction

Popular discourse among critical scholars and political leaders on the left maintains that globalization today is ruled by capitalism, if not defined by it. The goals of many anti-globalization movements indicate that their efforts are more accurately an opposition to global capitalism, imperialism of transnational corporations, and the hegemonic powers that maintain them, than an opposition to globalization per se. Under these domains of power, hierarchies maintain social order; exploitation of the lower classes and of natural resources feeds corporate giants; industries are oligopolized, compromising local markets and community sovereignty. Inequality is an inherent reality.

Based on Immanuel Wallerstein's theory of the capitalist world-system, and with supporting arguments from Karl Marx, I will describe the global capitalist economy. From there, I will review recent research on new social movements and reflect upon Michael Mann's theory of ideological power, which addresses the motivations for resistance and change. This analytical framework will guide my discussion of the formation and function of farmer's markets as an example of what Wallerstein identifies as anti-systemic movements. As such, these markets challenge global agribusiness by providing an alternative, 'idealized' market for local consumers and producers. To analyze this trend in the context of today's profit-centered paradigm of food production and trade, I will analyze the case of Baltimore's 32nd Street Farmer's Market. I will use information gathered through participant observation and interviews with vendors and the president of the farmer's market board. The central question I aim to answer is: How does the 32nd Street Farmer's Market reflect the community's demands for an alternative market and exist as a local expression of resistance to capitalism?

Theoretical approach: the capitalist world-system and anti-systemic movements

Wallerstein's world-systems theory of globalization features a global world-economy that shapes social relations: "It is a world-economy and it is by definition capitalist in form" (Wallerstein 1974: 415). Wallerstein analyzes the world in "totalities," and observes global trends of development and civilization throughout history that have shifted to create a social order that serves the interests and demands of a capitalist economy. A global hierarchy, a global division of labor, consisting of a core, a semi-periphery and a periphery, structures the capitalist world-economy. In this model, the world economy is led by and dominated by state and business actors based in the core, and is fueled by the exploitation of labor and resources in the periphery.

Borrowing some aspects from Adam Smith's analysis of the civilized society can help to explain the relationships that exist within Wallerstein's hierarchical order. Smith identified three orders of people in every "civilized society": "those who live by rent, those who live by wages, and those who live by profit" (Arrighi 1989: 3). Unlike the first two orders, whose interests "coincide" with the interests of the public, profit earners have interests that "are different from and even opposite to such general interest" (Arrighi 1989: 3). As the capitalist economy crosses boundaries of nation-states, and as those social orders become a world system of social classes, we notice that the behavior patterns of the profit-seekers result in limitations for the working classes and most consumers around the globe.

Marx also identified this shift away from national economies to world-economies. As a result of this globalization, the world orders became defined as the bourgeoisie and the proletariat: the minority elite of profit-seeking business owners, and the masses of working classes. Out of this class-dichotomy between the rich and the poor, anti-systemic movements are provoked as a response to growing, systemic inequality: "Along with the constantly diminishing magnates of capital...the mass of misery, oppression, slavery, degradation and exploitation, but with this too grows the revolt of the working-class" (Marx 1959). So, it is in this context of global capitalism and systemic inequality that the masses are motivated to question the validity of the system that oppresses them, and to mobilize for social change. These expressions of resistance are termed anti-systemic movements.

Effective opposition to capitalist practices tends to be manifest locally, where people organize for a similar cause to disrupt the systems that cause oppression and injustice (Sklair 1995: 495). Arrighi, Hopkins, and Wallerstein (1989) observed a turning point in the nature of anti-systemic movements in 1962. Since that year, new movements have challenged the logic of the capitalist system more centrally than ever before. Perhaps this can be attributed to the recent advancements in communication technologies, as people around the globe can mobilize and put pressure on their governments to make policy change and social reform.

Borrowing a theory from Michael Mann's work, *The Sources of Social Power*, I emphasize that the globalization of the world is an ongoing process with many forces of change. One source of power that is particularly influential in this case is the social power of ideology. Throughout time and history, "ideologies change as the problems we face change" (Mann 2013: 1). As groups of people share common enemies, or face a common threat, like small-scale farmers face the threat of large-scale industrial agriculture, movements of resistance can be mobilized. It is due to the prevalence of a dominant capitalist model of accumulation that individuals are motivated to question the system and "to contrast alternative and ideologically driven, morally loaded choices of meaningful exchange" (Gagné 2011: 286). We are reminded that the people have this power to cooperate and create alternative solutions for the common good. This resistance, although successful at a local or community level, "cannot hope to defeat national or global capitalism" (Sklair 1995: 496). Nonetheless, there are some lessons to be learned from alternative models exemplified by some anti-systemic movements, which I will discuss later.

The formation and function of farmer's markets as an anti-systemic movement

As small-scale farmers struggle to survive in a market dominated by transnational oligopolies, where they are often being run out of business or are unable to produce to the scale of industrial agribusinesses, an alternative market is necessary. A farmer's market can be defined as "a recurrent market at a fixed location where farms products are sold direct to consumers by farmers themselves" (Bubinas 2011: 155). Both farmer-producers and consumers benefit from these local markets. Farmers are able to sell their produce directly after harvesting to satisfy a small population's grocery needs. Consumers enjoy fresh and locally grown produce, straight from the farm. As a sustainable and autonomous mini-system, farmers markets operate outside of and in contradiction to the global food production chains that mark global agribusiness today. The farmer's market exists for its "distinction from the dominant economic model" (Gagné 2011: 286): the monopolization of corporate industry. Farmer's markets disrupt the profiting of private corporations by developing and maintaining alternative markets, by bringing more economic activity to the local level rather than expanding economy to other territories. In this way, the farmer's market is an active form of resistance, providing a "counter-hegemonic challenge" (Gagné 2011) in the form of alternative production, trade and consumption.

Farmer's markets appeal to specific social and economic values of food and consumption. They represent an "alternative approach to food production and distribution ... informed by communal ideals of an alternative lifestyle" (Bubinas 2011: 156). A general shift in the "ideology of consumerism" and a heightened social awareness of environmental and ethical concerns surrounding transnational corporations in agribusiness has led to the growing popularity of local food consumption in recent decades (Dodds, Holmes and Arunsopha 2014). These changes in consumer behavior are not only important for the sustained success of local farmers markets, but also reflect the ideological power of communities, which acts as a form of social movement that helps to promote the formation of farmer's markets in the first place.

The significance of the 'Third Space'

In a globalized world, where economies are run by transnational corporations and industrial giants, and where local sustainable production is becoming scarce, a farmer's market acts as a third space, a crack in the blanket of the capitalist domain. As neither mass-production-centered nor mass-consumption-driven, farmer's markets provide a local market that is likened to a trade-economy; rebuilding local economies by connecting the consumers to the producers once again.

In The Farmer's Basket in metropolitan Washington D.C., urban, middle-class customers and small-scale farmers "participate in an exchange that they deliberately infuse with the logic of ideological distinction," they create meaning and value in a space where they feel that they are participating in something ethically and ecologically moral,

something that they do not experience as consumers in corporate-run markets (Gagné 2011: 282). Farmers reveal nostalgic sentiments as the practice of buying food from local street vendors was “finally ‘coming back’ in the form of farmers markets;” one customer states that there is something fundamentally “anti-global” in the idea of a farmer’s market, and that “we should support local small or independent farmers rather than agribusiness” (Gagné 2011: 285). These statements reveal a shared understanding that this is a preferred alternative to competing with or consuming products from big corporate agribusiness.

Both shoppers and vendors benefit from the opportunity to be in contact with one another. Without the corporate agribusiness middlemen, farmer-producers sell their products for a better profit. Shoppers feel satisfied for supporting local farms and for having access to fresh, better tasting, organic foods. Essentially, the farmer’s market is a reflection of what James G. Carrier claims to be the underlying theory of the market, the “idealized form of buying and selling in a given political economy” (Gagné 2011: 281). The strength of the farmer’s market comes from the creation of community spaces where the market reflects consumer values and needs, as well as those of the farmer-producers.

Empowered by shared ideological and ethical values, this ‘third space’ allows for socialization and idealized exchange at a local level. It is here, in these community spaces, that seeds of change and resistance are planted. With this framework in mind, I would like to introduce the specific case of the 32nd Street Farmer’s Market in Baltimore. I will argue that this farmer’s market, like others, is an active pocket of opposition to big agribusiness; by reuniting consumers and producers, it is anti-systemic.

Analysis of case

In 1980, the 32nd Street Farmers Market was founded in the Waverly community, in the heart of Baltimore City. The market is a non-profit organization where farmer-producers sell their baked goods, seasonal fruits and vegetables, prepared foods, and flowers to local consumers. Its purpose is to provide an outlet for small-scale farmers and independent vendors to sell their products as well as to provide a variety of food products to an underserved city population. The money collected by this market is used to support its growth, and all additional profits are given back to the community in the form of annual grants to local nonprofit organizations (The 32nd Street Farmer’s Market).

In 2011, the Market Umbrella conducted a SEED economic impact report for the 32nd Street Farmer’s Market, which analyzed the impact of the market on the vendors, nearby businesses and on the local economy. This report found that the 32nd Street Farmers Market attracts approximately 4,167 shoppers per market day, that is, every Saturday from 7am-12pm, all year long. In its assessment of local participation, the report found that 54.82% of shoppers they interviewed attend the Market on a weekly basis, and 20.17% said they attend several times per month (SEED 2011). The top ten zip codes in which customers reside are those directly surrounding the Waverly community, with the highest percentage of customers residing in the same area as the marketplace (SEED). Not

only does this information reveal the market's success in reaching the local community, but it also indicated that the majority of shoppers rely on this market to satisfy their regular grocery needs.

The Market is truly producer-friendly, as it only allows for agricultural products and foods to be sold by the producers themselves, not by resellers or by market staff (SEED). The market space serves as a place where farmers and producers can sell their products direct to consumers, as an alternative to low-profit wholesale retail, or as an additional outlet for making their business visible to communities without the middleman; and as a place for new, startup businesses to get started, to contribute their skills, their unique specialties, and their passions to an otherwise limited marketplace. The Market is also managed and advised by members of its own community, elected advisors are all vendors or shoppers, no members of NGOs or government officials may be elected onto the Farmer's Market Board (SEED). In this way, the 32nd Street Farmer's Market is self-sustaining, and assures its ability to continue to best serve the needs and demands of both producers and consumers.

I attended the 32nd Street Farmer's Market on the mornings of April 18th and April 25th. During my visits, I observed the overall atmosphere to be a very social and interactive market experience. I engaged in conversations with vendors and customers, and had the opportunity to conduct an interview with one of the farmer-producers. In my interactions with vendors, I witnessed a wide variety of culinary talents and a beautiful array of produce. Through our conversations, I learned about their involvement in the market, how long they have been vending here, how they got started, and their thoughts on the result of this market for the community and for their own businesses. Many of the family farms expressed to me a preference for selling their products at this market over wholesale retail, as it is more profitable and much more satisfying. They enjoy the regular connection to shoppers. One man who has been in the farming business and has vended at this market ever since it was born described the market as a big family; and it truly felt that way.

The beginnings of this market are rooted in a collection of six food trucks that vended on a nearby side street in the late 1970s. These vendors have been taking on family businesses for generations and have committed to growing the local community markets ever since. One man, William E. Martin, of Martin Family Farms, has been working, farming and selling produce with his father since he was 12 years old. His father, William Martin Sr. was one of the original 6 vendors in the Charles village neighborhood, along with the Kaulk Family Farms, the Twining Farms, Lewis Farms and Lewis Orchards, Stoker Farms and the Blackrock Orchard. From there, "the market grew as demands grew," President of the Board, Marc Rey, informed me through our e-mail correspondence: "Customers asked for flower and plant farmers, meat and dairy farmers, good local bakers, etc. The Board listened and gradually expanded market vendors and offerings. We now have 50 vendors."

Among other members of the market community are local bakeries, food trucks, independent jam-makers, creative spice-mixers, and a booth with a greater variety of mushrooms I have ever seen. Many of the vendors are also part of community alliances,

such as the Farm Alliance of Baltimore, who are represented by Real Food Farms every Saturday morning. The Alliance has a number of urban farms around Baltimore city; some are for wholesale, some are community gardens where members come and grow food on their plots; some even have partnership programs with local schools. The members of this Market work together to promote new standards for fresh, healthy, local (and most of them organic) foods; and to provide an underserved population with better food and better nutrition: “The market’s mission has always been to make the freshest produce and other natural foods available to an underserved urban population,” says Marc Rey.

This market is unique in that it is open 12 months out of the year, and even in the brutal cold of winter, the market attracts its “die hard customers”, showing a preference for this produce over what this sold in supermarkets. When I asked vendors: What do you think keeps shoppers coming back week after week? “Quality and price” was the simple and quick response of many. Marc Rey, responded: “People choose to come here because they know the produce they buy was in the ground or on the tree just 24 hours ago and local. The eggs are very fresh, not weeks old. Little or no chemicals are ever used by our farmers. No antibiotics are ever fed the animals; chickens are free range. You can talk to any vendor about his/her products and how they were grown or produced. Try that in a grocery store!”

In all, the 32nd Street Farmer’s Market is an example of a successful community response to local needs: start-up and long-time farmers and producers are welcomed to vend their produce in this space on a regular basis, selling a wide variety of products at a low cost. Most shoppers come on a weekly basis, and feel better about the food they are buying. Cooperative efforts between farmers and community organizations provide opportunities throughout the city for people to have access to fresh, locally grown food. Members of the Board cooperate with other farmer’s markets in the city to implement policies and programs aimed at increasing the market’s accessibility to local communities: “Our market belongs to both a city coalition of farmers markets whose managers meet four times yearly and apply for grants to fund programs for the needy. We are also members of the Maryland Farmers Market Association and serve as a model market for new market managers to visit. We get incentive funding to increase the spending power of our food stamp (SNAP) customers, WIC and Senior customers, and we work with GEDCO/CARES to provide food for the poorest of area customers.” – Marc Rey.

This farmer’s market proves to be a successful anti-systemic movement in a number of ways. It has built and grown itself from a collective and cooperative community effort, driven by a common vision to support one another, and to make a variety of goods accessible to the community. A majority of shoppers come from surrounding neighborhoods, and more than half of them attend regularly. This indicates that the 32nd Street Farmer’s Market is a reliable and consistent grocery source for a large percentage of the surrounding community, if not the sole source for some households. Producers and consumers seem to prefer this market as an alternative to grocery stores and wholesale food production, as it creates a more personal and satisfying experience for both parties without the role of

corporate and industrial middlemen. Ultimately, as a part of the Maryland Farmer's Market Association, this market makes a cooperative effort to improve food accessibility and quality in all parts of Baltimore, expanding the local market impact. In a capitalist world-economy, where businesses are in constant competition, where they are concerned with advertising and promoting consumerism by all means, and where they aim to maximize profit at all costs, the farmer's market proves to be the opposite. The farmer's market runs on cooperative efforts of community members, as opposed to running on competition; it exists for the well being of the community, as opposed to existing to capitalize and grow for its own benefit.

Conclusion

Markets such as this can provide opportunities for a more just food system by allowing independent businesses to operate and reach consumers directly and by bringing production and consumption back to the local, building strong economies and more sustainable forms of production. Could the farmer's market be a new model for economic development? Could micro-economies resolve the social problems of food injustice, unemployment and environmental degradation that are only being exacerbated by the exploitative practices of the global agriculture industry? When calls for change are turned into action, one can be sure that there will be positive community growth. If the farmer's market is reflecting people's vision of an ideal market economy, perhaps we are already moving in a direction away from global capitalism, and are realizing the potential that exists in our own communities.

References

- Arrighi, Giovanni; Hopkins, Terrence K.; Wallerstein, Immanuel. 1989. *Anti-Systemic Movements*.
- Baltimore's 32nd Street Farmer's Market. 2015. Facebook. Online.
- Bubinas, Kathleen. 2011. "Farmers Markets in the Post-Industrial City." *City and Society* 23(2): 154-172.
- Dodds, Rachel; Holmes, Mark; Arunsopha, Vichukan. 2014. Consumer Choice and Farmers' Markets. *Journal of Agricultural and Environmental Ethics* 27 (3): 397-416
- Gagné, Nana Okura. 2011. "Eating Local in a U.S. City: Reconstructing "community" — a third place in a global neoliberal economy." *American Ethnologist* 38 (2): 281-293.
- Mann, Michael. 2013. *The Sources of Social Power* (Volume 4: Globalizations, 1945-2011).
- Marx, Karl. *Capital, the Communist Manifesto*. 1959
- SEED: sticky economy evaluation device. 2011. "The 32nd Street Farmer's Market (Waverly) 2011." marketumbrella.org (October): 1-12.
- Sklair, Leslie. 1995. "Social Movements and Global Capitalism." *Sociology* 29 (3). 495-512.
- The 32nd Street Farmer's Market. <http://www.32ndstreetmarket.org/index.html>
- Wallerstein, Immanuel. 1974. *The Modern World-System, vol. I: Capitalist Agriculture and the Origins of the European World-Economy in the Sixteenth Century*.



10 *The Growth and Benefits of Coffee Fair Trade: World Wide and Baltimore City*

Isabel Geisler

Introduction

One of the most defining characteristics of globalization is the increased interconnectivity of the world and, in turn, the ability to easily exchange goods between different regions. Global trade is one of the most recognizable drivers of globalization because there is profit to be gained and perhaps one of the greatest motivators of human innovation under capitalism is the chance to increase personal wealth. As such, it can be beneficial to for-profit organizations and to national states to promote and support this phenomenon. However, although populations have high expectations regarding the benefits of increased trade in commercial goods across countries, international trade often does not benefit all participants equally. In 1999, thousands of people gathered in Seattle to protest against the World Trade Organization on the grounds of unequal trade, exploitation, and neo-imperialism (Smith 2014). As it stands, capitalism has been the de facto mode of trade, but this has the potential to change as people grow up in a world where increased access to world travel and information has allowed them insight into the disparities between the Global North and Global South within a single capitalist world-economy. With this development, it is possible that there will be increased acknowledgment of non-negotiable human rights and fairness. Fair trade is one of the trade methods that have resulted from this attitude change and that has the potential to act as a “stepping stone” to more equal trade globally. Fair trade has the potential to benefit people in peripheral countries economically and socially as well as to provide its consumers with options that can increase their “global” participation and give them a sense of moral satisfaction.

Thread Coffee is a fair trade coffee roasting company based in Baltimore City, locally owned and whose products are globally sourced. Established in 2013, Thread Coffee is a small-local coffee roaster that is committed to transparent trade and to working directly with the farmers. Red Emma’s, a radical coffeehouse and bookstore that serves as Thread Coffee’s roasting site, saw a need for locally and fairly sourced coffee, and quickly established a partnership with Thread Coffee (McKeel & Fleming 2015). In this paper, Thread Coffee will serve as the subject of a case study based on theories of globalization. This study will (1) utilize theories from Adam Smith, Ulrich Beck and Immanuel Wallerstein to examine the social trends that have led to the commercial success of Thread Coffee, (2) examine the need for a new economic system and (3) gauge the success of fair trade in providing economic and social benefits to both consumers and producers globally. Articles and texts from academic journals and lectures will be summarized in order to explain the growth of fair trade since its conception and to provide insight to the benefits, the current environment, and the controversies that surround the fair trade movement. All findings

on Thread Coffee have been recorded via personal interview with some of the leaders and collaborators within the organization.

Theoretical approach:

Adam Smith, Ulrich Beck, and Immanuel Wallerstein are well known theorists of globalization, even though Smith wrote in a time when the term globalization was not yet popular. Wallerstein's texts often focus on the shortcomings and perhaps "end" of capitalism (Wallerstein 1974). Fairtrade is one potential model that could offer a path to an alternative economic system to fill the gap left by capitalism as well as to fulfill the needs of marginalized and disenfranchised groups. Adam Smith outlined a number of needs that liberal globalization can satisfy (Alvey 2003). This paper will argue that systems like fair trade can accomplish the goals pointed out by Smith more effectively than capitalism. Smith would most likely be a stronger supporter of free trade rather than of fair trade, if he were alive today. However, this paper will argue that fair trade is more effective at fulfilling the goals and hopes that Adam Smith set for free trade due to the gross inequalities caused by the current capitalist system, which actually departs, in important ways, from Smith's ideal of a liberal globalization based on free trade. Finally, Ulrich Beck theorizes that one of the results of increased globalization is the development of cosmopolitan "human norms" (Beck 2008). This paper will expand on what human norms are and how they can shape the trade policies and consumption of the United States and other high-income countries.

Adam Smith is a renowned economist best known for his advocacy and theorization of what is today known as the free trade system, one of the goals he set for his ideal capitalist society. In this vision for globalization, Smith had two moral theories: (1) there are certain universal human characteristics and (2) morality develops from these characteristics. With these two theories in mind, free trade is ultimately beneficial to people because by reducing trade barriers between populations, the morality of individuals and prosperity of trade can positively impact more of society (Alvey 2003). With this in mind, he advocated for the "overthrow" of mercantilism and the institution of free trade. To Smith, international trade was a means towards peace and he was worried by the potential lack of morality in the European mistreatment of colonized peoples. While mercantilism was tied to monopolies, war, coercion, and "zero-sum" transactions, Smith saw liberalism as an alternative. His vision included six goals: competition, peace, cosmopolitanism, voluntary relations (between states), a positive-sum game [of trade], and religious pluralism. Free trade and capitalism, however, may not be the best means to achieving these goals. Freer trade is supposed to increase cultural and international wellbeing by ensuring specialization and the exchange of high-quality goods (Alvey 2013). Smith's goals of free trade and neoliberal globalization are admirable - but appear to have been corrupted by the imperial history of the globe and human greed gone unchecked.

Immanuel Wallerstein is a contemporary theorist who is famous for his world-systems analysis. World-systems theory is a critique to modernization theory, the theory that states that all national societies pass through the same stages as they "develop" from

tradition to modernity (Wallerstein 1974). This, according to Wallerstein, is flawed thinking because today's modern societies are only modern because they have "exploited traditional societies" (Wallerstein 1974: 392). Wallerstein argues that the current world-system is defined by capitalism and many of the current institutions function to further and protect capitalism. He divides the world into three different areas: the core, periphery, and semi-periphery. People in the periphery are in a constant state of subordination to actors based in the core (Wallerstein 1974).

Finally, Ulrich Beck speaks of the creation of human norms across national boundaries. With Beck's assertions in mind, it is important to investigate whether current development of cosmopolitan human norms is in conflict with the current international trade laws (such as the North American Trade Agreement), which may allow unconsciously exploitation. Like Wallerstein, Beck also critiques neoliberalism and compares it to a "military rationale of power." Low-income Countries (LICs) must make themselves open for investment in order to avoid the economic fallout that would occur if large transnational companies or were to withdraw from their markets. Beck creates an argument that centers around cosmopolitanism on the macro-level commenting that, "the walls between them [states] must be replaced by bridges. Those bridges must be primarily erected in human heads, mentalities, imagination" (Beck 2008).

The aforementioned arguments will be used to assess the benefits of fair trade and its potential for success. The operators of Thread Coffee, view fair trade not only as an alternative to neoliberal free trade, but also as a stepping stone to a new global economic model (McKeel & Fleming 2015). Fair trade is a viable alternative that can be evaluated (through the use of Adam Smith's theory on neoliberalism) by its capacity to result in global stability and peace, create voluntary relations between organizations, create a positive-sum game of trade, and create an environment of cosmopolitanism. In the following sections I will utilize the assertions by each individual theorist to analyze the attractiveness of Fair Trade to consumers and producers and examine its capabilities of developing into a larger more mainstream mode of trade.

Analysis of case

Fair trade is a new way of approaching trade. It has origins in the 1960's and was created out of field experience between church leaders and the international communities that they worked with (Stenn 2014). Fair trade involves the "mutually beneficial exchange" between the producers and consumers while weakening the power of intermediaries. Ultimately, the goal of fair trade is to improve the "living and working conditions" of small-farmers (Modelo 2014). Though a young movement, it has seen a rapid growth. From 2003 to 2011, the consumption of fair trade products grew by 50% (Tellman, Gray, & Bacon 2011). This being said, it is hard for "traditional" economics to explain the rise of the fair trade market, which is embedded in more sociological and cosmopolitan changes rather than scientific or easily quantifiable trends (Shorette 2014). Instead, fair trade growth can be

traced to society's "belief in global citizenship through global brands" (Strizhakova, Coulter, & Price 2012). But what allows this expansion and defines this need to be a "global citizen"? Kristen Shorette attempted to study fair trade's growth through a series of qualitative analysis and made the following observation: "Only after a shift in world cultural norms that favor equality, human rights, and environmentalism do processes of unequal exchange become problematized allowing for the formation of fair trade markets. New world cultural norms provide the framework for alternative institutional preconditions for markets so that movements toward regulation counter moves toward liberalization in international trade" (Shorette 2014: 17).

Shorette's findings complement Beck's own observations on human norms, though neither scholar is entirely sure of the origin of these norms. Smith's goals and moral theory, however, do align with some of the results of fair trade on local communities and may explain the popularity of the movement for Baltimore consumers. Fair trade's success is based on the amount of opportunity it can give capable farmers and this locally prescribed and driven approach has been proven to have numerous benefits. Farmers report an increase in self-esteem, pride in new skills, positive economic outcomes, stable coffee floor prices, independence through premiums, improved working conditions, and lessened environmental degradation (Modelo 2014; Dragusanu, Giovannucci, & Nunn 2014; Stenn 2014). Fair trade provides these farmers an escape from the competitive, exploitive capitalist system.

Thread Coffee serves as a global example of fair trade's positive effects on a local level. Like the fair trade movement, Thread seeks to pay "just prices" to its coffee producers, keeping in mind the standard of living in each country they work in (McKeel & Fleming 2015). But Thread also goes a step further than the major Fair Trade organizations because it not only stresses transparency and consumer education, but they treat their business relations as partnerships. For example, a growing problem in the coffee-growing communities Thread works with is the growing threat of La Roya, a disease which is correlated with rising temperatures and reduces coffee yields (McKeel & Fleming 2015). Many other fair trade companies, however, are not as transparent and are more focused on finding high-quality coffee rather than ethically sourced coffee, a business strategy that has often hindered the positive effects of fair trade in many communities (Stenn, 2014; McKeel & Fleming, 2015). This mirrors the ongoing ideological battles occurring in the global Fair Trade community between Fair Trade International and Fair Trade USA, two of the largest Fair Trade brands that just recently split due to ideological differences (Modelo 2014). Thread Coffee is not only a global company because of its connections to multiple countries, but also because they can offer insight into broader system debates.

Immanuel Wallerstein invites his readers to view history and current events in a broader, more contextual manner. One of his most interesting arguments is that modern capitalism is not sustainable. According to Wallerstein, a "world wide economic crisis will be reached and the capitalist world-system will collapse, opening the way for revolutionary change" (Wallerstein 1974). Twenty five million people depend on the production of coffee

beans for their livelihoods, mainly in low-income countries (Austin 2014). Fair trade is based on the principle of reducing the trade deficits between the Global North and South and is a “mutually beneficial” exchange of goods rather than an exploitation of cheap labor (Model 2014). According to one of Thread Coffee’s co-owners, paying producers fairer prices can improve communities both economically and socially. For example, one co-op in Peru used the money they had saved from producing coffee to research the prevalence of lung cancer in women. They discovered that poor ventilation in cooking areas was equivalent to smoking two cigarette packs everyday and since the women spent most time in the kitchens they were the most vulnerable. As a result, this community is now saving their Fair Trade premiums to improve ventilation in the kitchens (McKeel & Fleming 2015). Peru could be categorized a peripheral state and the indigenous communities themselves would not have been afforded money by their government to conduct research, let alone improve health conditions. However, fair trade has given these coffee-farmers and opportunity to bypass exploitation and economic disempowerment. If the modern system of international exchange was built in the interest of “serving capitalists” it will be beneficial to investigate a mode of trade, such as fair trade, that also seeks to benefit workers and that could serve as the alternative to capitalism that Wallerstein and other theorists are searching for (Wallerstein 1974).

It may at first seem counter-productive to use Adam Smith for this paper, being him an economist that would not be a supporter of highly regulated trade. However, it is notable that fair trade has the possibility of fulfilling Smith’s goals of “liberal globalization” far better than real-world capitalism. While free trade and competition are two of the most prominent elements of liberal globalization, it is important to keep in mind Smith’s six other goals. In many cases capitalism may be perpetuating inequality, notably in the exchange of raw goods and agricultural products, such as coffee. Although coffee is an important commodity on the global market (annually earning \$60 billion), it is “produced exclusively” in LICs which are also the largest producers of most raw goods (Austin 2012). Fair trade with its numerous aforementioned benefits (such as personal empowerment and independence) seems to fulfill many of Smith’s goals.

In line with Adam Smith’s goal of “cosmopolitanism and moral improvement,” Thread Coffee provides an excellent example of solidarity and inter-cultural connections. Las Abejas is a pacifistic, indigenous community that was often targeted by the Mexican paramilitary, created Maya Vinic a coffee cooperative as a means of ensuring their autonomy from the Mexican government. In 1997, the military was famous for taking part in an Acteal Massacre in which forty-five Abejas were killed while they attended a Roman Catholic prayer service. With few means of supporting themselves, Las Abejas chose to grow coffee, which was greeted by international support by those who purchased it in solidarity. People across the globe were able to learn of Las Abejas story and support them economically through fair trade, something that would not have been possible without international economic networks (McKeel & Fleming 2015). Similarly, fair trade served as a means for people to exercise their global participation and passively advocate for “Moral Improvement.”

Fair trade can only succeed as an economic and social model and brand if there is a demand for its presence. Beck asserts that one of the most influential factors in predicting a state's power is the economic power that state wields, affirming that "The threat is no longer of an invasion but of the non-invasion (or withdrawal) of investors" and "investment capital is the equivalent of firepower – with the big difference that the threat of not firing enlarges the power" (Beck 2008: 796). Fair trade not only challenges the systems that ensure this trade imbalance, but Beck's arguments also provide validity to Fair trade's rise and its propensity as substitution for capitalism. In his research, Beck outlines new developments associated with globalization and although some of his findings do not take into account broader historical movements, he ties the development of cosmopolitanism and human norms to the weakening of hard, cultural and political boundaries (Beck 2008). Just as Shorette observes, Fair trade and its growth are tied to the human desire to be "global" and the moral obligation to be "just" (Stenn 2014). These inclinations may be positively correlated to the exposure of new cultures and ideas –as Beck puts it "Cosmopolitanism is about inclusive distinctions and loyalties (being citizens of two worlds – cosmos and polis)" (Beck 2008). One of Thread Coffee's missions is to raise awareness on the meaning of Fair Trade and to enhance the global participation of consumers. For almost all of their coffees, they provide descriptions of the communities they sourced the coffee from. For example for a special "FORCE: Against Rape Culture Blend" (a Baltimore movement and non-profit) Thread Coffee utilized beans from a woman's empowerment co-op in the Congo. They find that emphasizing these connections are important not only because it encourages people to buy fair trade goods by providing a "face" to the producer, but also because it allows producers to be connected to their coffee on a deeper level. Producers of fair trade report a great deal of satisfaction from knowing that the people buying roasts made from their coffee beans enjoy it (McKeel & Fleming 2015).

Just as fair trade has experienced growth globally, it has also experienced its own boom in Baltimore City. Since Thread's conception in 2013, it has continued to grow in popularity because it allows people the ability to create international connections through consumer a product and gives people the opportunity to participate in the promotion of global justice. In an interview conducted with Thread members, the observation was made that "a person in Baltimore can buy coffee here and think of farmers as they are drinking that coffee"; as this observation demonstrates, people have become incredibly interconnected in the present world (McKeel & Fleming 2015).

Conclusion

Fair trade is a global movement that can easily be analyzed at a local level. As Thread Coffee demonstrates, local consumers enjoy being able to connect to communities across the globe and, by participating in ethical trade, they can not only empower these communities economically but also socially. Adam Smith had certain goals he thought free trade could obtain but it appears that fair trade also has the capability of fulfilling these

goals by providing stable income for farmers and giving them the economic opportunity to invest in their communities. Immanuel Wallerstein highlighted the wealth disparities between the Global North and South due to exploitation by actors based in high-income countries often legitimized by international institutions. As shown by the experience of one of Thread's producers, fair trade is empowering because it provides a means to bypass these hierarchical relations. Finally, fair trade and Thread Coffee have seen an increase in sales and recognition due to the development of global human norms, as we could expect from the perspective of Ulrich Beck. Thread Coffee strives to increase consumer's awareness of foreign farmers and its co-owners believe that this ability to relate and help across national boundaries is growing more profound and sufficient enough to aid in the success of fair trade. One of the strengths of fair trade is clearly its ability to empower local communities and enact global change in a locally directed level, for example, in the case of Peru or Las Abejas in Mexico. The progress in these regions was community-led, which suggests that this model could be successfully incorporated in the strategies and efforts of those involved in international development.

References

- Arnold, C. 2009. *Ethical marketing and the new consumer*. Chichester, U.K.: Wiley.
- Austin, K. 2012. "Coffee exports as ecological, social, and physical unequal exchange: A cross-national investigation of the java trade." *International Journal Of Comparative Sociology* (Sage Publications, Ltd.). 53(3): 155-180.
- Alvey, J. E. 2003. "Adam Smith's Globalization (but anti-Secularization) theory." Massey University. Department of Applied and International Economics Discussion Papers.
- Beck, U. 2008. "Reframing Power in the Globalized World," *Organization Studies* 29(5): 793-804.
- McKeel, C & Fleming, M. 2015. Interview with Thread Coffee & Red Emma's [Personal interview]. March 23, 2015.
- Modelo, M. 2014. "The Paradox of Fair Trade." *Standford Social Innovation Review*. 12(1).
- Smith, Noah. 2014. "The Dark Side of Globalization: Why Seattle's 1999 Protesters Were Right." *The Atlantic*.
- Shorette, K. 2014. "Nongovernmental Regulation and Construction of Value in Global Markets: The Rise of Fair Trade, 1961-2006." *Sociological Perspectives*, 57(4): 526-547-526-547.
- Stenn, T. 2014. "Fair Trade and Justice: A Case Study of Fair Trade and its Effect on the Freedom of Bolivia's Indigenous Women." *Bolivian Studies Journal*. 20: 196-215.
- Strizhakova, Y., Coulter, R., & Price, L. 2012. "The young adult cohort in emerging markets: Assessing their global cultural identity in a global marketplace." *International Journal of Research in Marketing*, 29(1): 43-54.
- Tellman, B., Gray, L., & Bacon, C. 2011. "Not Fair Enough: Historic and Institutional Barriers to Fair Trade Coffee in El Salvador." *Journal of Latin American Geography*: 107-127.
- Wallerstein, I. 1974. "The Rise and Future Demise of the World Capitalist System: Concepts for Comparative Analysis," *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 16:4, 387-414.



